



EXECUTIVE COUNCIL CHAMBERS

30 September 2019

John Luke
fyi-request-11114-f1d3de46@requests.fyi.org.nz

Reference: OIA-2019/20-0127

Dear John Luke

Official Information Act request: Reason for not Issuing a Diamond Jubilee Medal

Thank you for your Official Information Act 1982 (the Act) request received on 2 September 2019. You requested:

"...I would like to know the reason why NZ at that time didn't issue the Diamond Jubilee Medal to celebrate The Queen Elizabeth II's Diamond Jubilee. I understand UK and Canada did issue the medal. Also, please send me any discussion papers or memos related to this matters...."

New Zealand has not previously issued its own, separate medal to commemorate a Sovereign's jubilee, or coronation. In the past, some New Zealanders have received United Kingdom jubilee or coronation medals. The United Kingdom Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012 was issued to a very small number of New Zealanders, including the living holders of the Victoria Cross for New Zealand, the New Zealand Cross, and the George Cross.

When planning celebrations for the Queen's Diamond Jubilee in 2012, the government of the day decided that New Zealand's approach to these celebrations should be open, inclusive, and reflective of the environment of fiscal constraint at that time. The issuing of a medal can be expensive, and by their nature jubilee medals are exclusive of most of the New Zealand population by being allocated to people on the basis of a role or position that they hold. As a result, the government did not consider that the issuing of a New Zealand Diamond Jubilee medal aligned with the overall approach adopted for celebrating the Jubilee.

Please find enclosed two memos that were provided to the sitting Prime Minister by the Cabinet Office on the issuing of a Diamond Jubilee Medal:

- *Issue of the UK Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012 to specific New Zealand award-holders and office-holders: dated 23 September 2011*
- *Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012: dated 21 October 2011*

Also enclosed is a note from the New Zealand Herald of Arms Extraordinary, Phillip Patrick O'Shea, to the Secretary of Cabinet.

Redactions to the documents provided have been made under one or more of the following sections of the Act:

- section 9(2)(f)(i), to maintain the constitutional convention for the time being which protects the confidentiality of communications by or with the Sovereign or her representative; and
- section 9(2)(g)(i), to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinions by or between or to Ministers of the Crown or members of an organisation or officers and employees of any department or organisation in the course of their duty.

You have the right to ask the Ombudsman to investigate and review my decision under section 28(3) of the Act.

Yours sincerely



Michael Webster
Clerk of the Executive Council

CEC-HS-06/01
FILE



**EXECUTIVE COUNCIL
 CHAMBERS**

Memo

23 September 2011

To Prime Minister

From Rebecca Kitteridge

Subject **Issue of the UK Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012 to specific New Zealand award-holders and office-holders**

Summary

- 1 The UK will issue a Diamond Jubilee Medal (DJM) in 2012 to mark the Queen's Diamond Jubilee. Traditionally, jubilee medals are offered to all living holders of the Victoria Cross and George Cross, including any New Zealand holders of these awards. Any New Zealanders who are members of the Royal Household may also be offered a medal. [redacted] s 9(2)(g)(i);
 [redacted] s 9(2)(f)(i)
- 2 [redacted] s 9(2)(g)(i)
- 3 The Queen will confer the DJM as the "Queen of the UK", not as the "Queen of New Zealand". As such, your approval is required for any New Zealand citizens to accept and wear the medal, should they be offered it.
- 4 This memo seeks your agreement in principle for [redacted] New Zealand citizens to accept and wear the medal, should they be offered it; one VC holder, two GC holders, [redacted], and one member of the Royal Household. s 9(2)(f)(i); s 9(2)(g)(i)

Coronation and Jubilee medals

- 5 The Sovereign may issue coronation and jubilee medals as personal awards. Appendix 1 attaches a description of coronation and jubilee medals from 1935 – 1977.
- 6 The last such medal issued was the Golden Jubilee Medal, in 2002. All living VC and GC holders received the medal, including the three living GC holders New Zealand. The VC for New Zealand, instituted in 1999, had not yet been awarded. [redacted] s 9(2)(f)(i);
 [redacted] s 9(2)(g)(i)
- 7 You have decided that New Zealand will not issue its own DJM. The UK medal will also not be available for issue in New Zealand.

New Zealand citizens likely to be eligible for the Diamond Jubilee Medal

8 NZDF has been informally contacted by the VC and GC Association in the UK, which has advised that living VC and GC holders will receive the DJM, in accordance with custom and practice. [REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i)

9 There is one holder of the Victoria Cross for New Zealand (Corporal Willie Apiata) and two holders of the George Cross who were originally UK citizens but are now New Zealand citizens.

10 Traditionally, New Zealanders who are members of the Royal Household may also be offered a medal. [REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i)
[REDACTED] There is one member of the Royal Household (ex-officio) in New Zealand: the New Zealand Herald of Arms Extraordinary, Phillip O'Shea.

[REDACTED] s 9(2)(g)(i)

11 [REDACTED]

Acceptance of Commonwealth honours by New Zealand citizens

12 *The Rules Relating to the Acceptance and Wearing of Commonwealth, Foreign and International Honours by New Zealand Citizens* (the Rules) provide delegated authority to the Prime Minister to approve the acceptance and wearing of any Commonwealth honour by a New Zealand citizen. As the DJM will be issued by the Queen as the 'Queen of the UK', it is effectively a Commonwealth honour. The Prime Minister's approval is required for any New Zealanders to accept and wear the medal, should they be offered it.

13 Persons in the service of the Crown are not, generally speaking, eligible to receive Commonwealth and foreign honours. Corporal Apiata is still in active service with NZDF, and Phillip O'Shea provides advice on a retainer basis for the Cabinet Office, on matters relating to heraldry and honours. Approval may be granted, however, where the Prime Minister considers it is "in the best interests of New Zealand". Given the nature of this medal, we doubt there would be any difficulty in recommending that you grant approval in this case.

Next steps

14 [REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i);
[REDACTED] s 9(2)(g)(i)

Recommendations

15 I recommend that you:

15.1 **note** that the UK plans to issue a Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012, and is likely to offer it to all holders of the VC and GC, as well as members of the Royal Household;

HONOURS : IN CONFIDENCE

15.2 **note** that as the Diamond Jubilee Medal is a Commonwealth honour from another country (from the Queen of the UK as opposed to the Queen of New Zealand), your approval will be needed for any New Zealand citizen to accept and wear the medal;

15.3 **note** our advice that we see no difficulty, in principle, in granting approval in this case;

15.4 **indicate** whether you agree in principle with the award of the UK Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012 to the following New Zealand citizens, should they be offered it:

15.4.1 Holders of the Victoria Cross for New Zealand (one);

AGREE / DISAGREE / DISCUSS

15.4.2 Holders of the George Cross in New Zealand (two);

AGREE / DISAGREE / DISCUSS

15.4.3 [REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i); s 9(2)(g)(i)

AGREE / DISAGREE / DISCUSS

15.4.4 The New Zealand Herald of Arms Extraordinary, as an ex-officio member of the Royal Household;

AGREE / DISAGREE / DISCUSS

15.5 **note** that we will advise the Palace of your view, [REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i) and will await formal confirmation that the Diamond Jubilee Medal will be offered to the five individuals.

Rebecca
Rebecca Kitteridge
Clerk of the Executive Council

Rt Hon John Key
Prime Minister

Date: 26 / 9 / 11

Distribution:
Wayne Eagleson – Chief of Staff

Previous Coronation and Jubilee medals awarded (1935 – 1977)

The Sovereign may issue coronation and jubilee medals as personal awards.

Until 1997, the UK allocated a proportion of the total coronation and jubilee medals struck to each of the Commonwealth countries, then left it to the local authorities to decide who would receive a medal, and why. Previous coronation and jubilee medals that have been awarded to New Zealanders, are listed below.

Silver Jubilee Medal 1935 (King George V)

This medal was awarded in large numbers to citizens of the British Empire, including military and civilian New Zealanders. All living VC holders received the medal.

King George VI Coronation Medal 1937

This medal was awarded in large numbers to citizens of the British Commonwealth, including military and civilian New Zealanders. All living VC and GC holders received the medal.

Coronation Medal 1953 (Queen Elizabeth II)

This medal was issued to about 2,500 New Zealanders, for various services, including selected New Zealand military personnel involved in the celebrations in the UK (eg those in the coronation procession). Sir Edmund Hillary received the medal from the Queen several weeks later, after his ascent of Mt Everest. All living VC and GC holders received the medal.

Silver Jubilee Medal 1977 (Queen Elizabeth II)

The medal was issued to about 30,000 persons throughout the British Commonwealth, including 1,507 selected military and civilian New Zealanders. All living VC and GC holders received the medal. (The VC holders appeared on the New Zealand list, while the three living GC holders, who received their GCs for their actions while they were associated with British forces, were included on the British list.) New Zealand's Governor-General, Prime Minister, and High Commissioner in London also received the medal, on the Queen's Privy Purse.



EXECUTIVE COUNCIL
CHAMBERS

FILE

CEC-HS-06-01

Memo

21 October 2011

s 9(2)(g)(i)

To Prime Minister

From Rebecca Kitteridge

Subject Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012

Purpose

- 1 Cabinet, at its meeting on 10 October 2011 noted that you would explore the merits of New Zealand issuing a New Zealand Diamond Jubilee Medal (DJM). You have previously agreed not to issue a separate New Zealand DJM. This briefing outlines why we recommend that no New Zealand DJM be issued.

Diamond Jubilee Medals: What other realms are doing

- 2 **The UK** will issue a DJM in 2012 to mark the Queen's Diamond Jubilee. The medal will be awarded to:
- 2.1 members of the armed forces (regular and reserves), emergency services personnel (paid and voluntary), operational prison services personnel, and all Police Community Support Officers. All of the above must be serving as at 6 February 2012, and have completed five years of service;
- 2.2 living holders of the Victoria Cross (VC) and George Cross (GC);
- 2.3 members of the Royal household.
- 3 Traditionally, jubilee medals are offered to all living VC and GC holders, and members of the Royal household – some of whom may not be UK citizens. You have agreed, in principle, that [redacted] New Zealand citizens may accept and wear the UK DJM, should they be offered it (one VC holder, two GC holders, [redacted], and one member of the Royal household). [redacted] s 9(2)(f)(i);
s 9(2)(g)(i)
- 4 **Canada** has announced that it plans to issue a DJM. The Canadian medal will be issued to 60,000 Canadian citizens or permanent residents who have "made significant contributions to Canada or to a particular province, territory, region or community within Canada, or for an outstanding achievement abroad that has brought great credit to Canada".
- 5 **Australia** has decided not to issue a DJM.

Previous New Zealand involvement in official UK medal issues

- 6 New Zealand has not previously issued its own, separate medal to commemorate a Sovereign's jubilee, or coronation. In the past, some New Zealanders have received UK jubilee or coronation medals, including:
 - 6.1 1935: King George V's Silver Jubilee Medal was awarded in large numbers to citizens of the British Empire, including military and civilian New Zealanders;
 - 6.2 1937: King George VI's Coronation Medal was awarded in large numbers to citizens of the British Commonwealth, including military and civilian New Zealanders;
 - 6.3 1953: Queen Elizabeth II's Coronation Medal was issued to about 2,500 New Zealanders, for various services, including selected New Zealand military personnel involved in the celebrations in the UK (eg those in the coronation procession). Sir Edmund Hillary received the medal from the Queen several weeks later, after his ascent of Mt Everest;
 - 6.4 1977: Queen Elizabeth II's Silver Jubilee Medal was issued to about 30,000 people throughout the British Commonwealth, including 1,507 selected military and civilian New Zealanders. New Zealand's Governor-General, Prime Minister, and High Commissioner in London also received the medal;
 - 6.5 2002: Queen Elizabeth II's Golden Jubilee Medal was issued to the three living GC holders in New Zealand. (The VC for New Zealand, instituted in 1999, had not yet been awarded.) No other New Zealanders received the medal.
- 7 The reduction in the numbers of New Zealanders receiving UK jubilee or coronation medals reflects New Zealand's evolution, since 1935, from colony to independent nation.

Should a New Zealand Diamond Jubilee Medal be issued?

- 8 Consistent with New Zealand's status as an independent, sovereign nation, there is no suggestion that New Zealand citizens will receive the official UK DJM (with the very limited exceptions set out in paragraph 3). The question is whether New Zealand should issue its own DJM in 2012 (like Canada) or not (like Australia).
- 9 Given the current fiscal constraints, [REDACTED], we have s 9(2)(f)(i) recommended to you that the general approach we should take to the Queen's Diamond Jubilee is open, inclusive and low-cost. The issue of a medal does not sit easily within that approach:
 - 9.1 **Cost:** Medals are expensive. An estimated cost for a full-size medal, miniature, and presentation box, is \$50, and the approximate cost of administration (developing eligibility criteria and putting in place the necessary machinery to administer and distribute the medal) is another \$50 per medal (figures based on the New Zealand Defence Force's recent experience in distributing the Defence Service Medal). Canada is planning to distribute 60,000 medals, which (based on their population of 34 million) is roughly one medal per 500 people. Were New Zealand to issue a similar level of medals, the cost would be approximately \$880,000. Even if we were only to issue, say, 3000 medals, which is roughly one medal per 1,500 people, this would cost at least \$300,000. There is a risk that this sort of expenditure, at a time of fiscal constraint, could result in negative publicity and feeling about what is meant to be a celebratory event.

9.2 **Exclusivity:** Medals, by their nature, are exclusive of much of the New Zealand population. As mentioned, these types of medals are usually issued on an ex-officio basis – i.e. because of recipients’ roles or jobs, and not because of any personal achievement or service to the nation. Any merit-based approach would add to the cost of administration and could be contentious.

10 Our experience of administering the distribution of the New Zealand allocation of the UK Silver Jubilee Medal in 1977 was that it was time-intensive, and generated some ill-will, as people received it on an ex-officio basis.

11 [Redacted text] s 9(2)(f)(i)

12 For these reasons, we continue to recommend that New Zealand not issue a DJM in 2012.

Recommendations

13 I recommend that you:

13.1 **note** that you have previously agreed that no medal be issued for the Queen’s Diamond Jubilee;

13.2 **note** that Cabinet, at its meeting on 10 October 2011, noted you would explore the merits of a Diamond Jubilee medal;

13.3 **agree** that New Zealand will not issue its own Diamond Jubilee Medal;

~~AGREE / DISAGREE / DISCUSS~~

13.4 **agree** to convey this decision to your Cabinet colleagues.

~~AGREE / DISAGREE / DISCUSS~~

Rebecca
Rebecca Kitteridge
Clerk of the Executive Council

Rt Hon John Key
Prime Minister

Date: 20 / 1 / 11

Distribution:
Wayne Eagleson – Chief of Staff



Cabinet

CAB Min (11) 37/21

Copy No: 8

Minute of Decision

This document contains information for the New Zealand Cabinet. It must be treated in confidence and handled in accordance with any security classification, or other endorsement. The information can only be released, including under the Official Information Act 1982, by persons with the appropriate authority.

The Queen's Diamond Jubilee

Portfolio: Prime Minister

On 10 October 2011, Cabinet:

- 1 **noted** that 2012 will be the Queen's Diamond Jubilee marking the 60th anniversary of her accession to the throne of New Zealand;
- 2 **noted** that Diamond Jubilee celebrations will take place in most of the 16 realms over which the Queen is head of state, including New Zealand;
- 3 **noted** that the Prime Minister has agreed that:
 - 3.1 New Zealand's general approach to Diamond Jubilee celebrations should be to:
 - 3.1.1 be low-cost, flexible, and open to all New Zealanders to participate in their own way, if they choose;
 - 3.1.2 make use of government-led events that are already likely to occur, by tying them to the Diamond Jubilee;
 - 3.1.3 enable private groups and organisations to associate their own events with the Diamond Jubilee in a formal way;
- 4 **noted** that the Prime Minister will explore the merits of a Diamond Jubilee medal;
- 5 **noted** that the Queen:
 - 5.1 has approved a design for a Diamond Jubilee coin to be issued by New Zealand Post Limited;
 - 5.2 will shortly approve a design for a Diamond Jubilee emblem which will be available for use by organisations wishing to associate their events with the Diamond Jubilee;
- 6 **noted** that:
 - 6.1 on the first available sitting day closest to Accession day (6 February 2012), in consultation with the Leader of the House, the Prime Minister will raise a motion in the House seeking agreement that it pass a resolution congratulating the Queen;

- 6.2 the Prime Minister will consider an appropriate gift for the Queen;
- 6.3 the New Zealand Army Band will participate in the Diamond Jubilee Pageant at Windsor Castle in May 2012;
- 6.4 officials are considering options for elements to comprise New Zealand's programme of celebrations for the Diamond Jubilee, including initiatives from the Ministry of Economic Development, the Ministry for Culture and Heritage, the Department of Conservation, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, the Department of Corrections, the New Zealand Defence Force, and the New Zealand Customs Service, the Department of Labour, and Te Puni Kokiri;
- 7 **noted** that the Prime Minister will report to the Cabinet Domestic Policy Committee in March 2012 with an update on New Zealand's Diamond Jubilee programme of events and commemorations.

Rebecca Kitteridge
Secretary of the Cabinet

Reference: CAB (11) 598

Distribution:

Prime Minister
Chief Executive, DPMC
Director PAG, DPMC
Chief Executive, MED (Tourism)
Minister of Finance
Secretary to the Treasury
Minister of Corrections
Chief Executive, Department of Corrections
Minister for Arts, Culture and Heritage
Chief Executive, Ministry for Culture and Heritage
Minister of Foreign Affairs
Secretary of Foreign Affairs and Trade
Minister of Defence
Secretary of Defence
Chief of Defence Force
Minister of Immigration
Secretary of Labour (Immigration)
Minister of Conservation
Director-General of Conservation
Minister of Customs
Comptroller of Customs
Minister of Maori Affairs
Chief Executive, Te Puni Kokiri
Clerk of the Executive Council
Secretary, DOM

HONOURS IN CONFIDENCE

Jubilee and Coronation Medals

Official medals (for wear) to mark a jubilee and coronation have been issued since 1887.

Issues to holders of VC and GC

Since the 1935 Silver Jubilee Medal of King George V all living holders of the VC, and since the 1953 Coronation of Queen Elizabeth II, all living holders of the GC, have received, ex-officio, jubilee and coronation medals. In the case of New Zealanders these have appeared on either a New Zealand or British list of medallists.

The Queen's Silver Jubilee Medal 1977

This medal was issued to all living holders of the VC and GC. The VC holders appear on the New Zealand list while the three GC, who all received their GC (by exchange with an AM or EGM) while with the British RAF, RN or MN, were included in a British list.

The medal was issued largely on an ex-officio basis i.e. all judges, MPs, Mayors with selections made for community groups and within NZDF, Police, Fire, and like.

In 1977 the New Zealand Governor-General, Prime Minister and the High Commissioner in London received a medal on The Queen's Privy Purse, as opposed to the New Zealand, list of Medallists.

The Queen's Golden Jubilee Medal 2002

[REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i)
[REDACTED] In the UK the medal was issued on a very different basis to that for previous medals. Australia did not participate. Canada issued its own medal.

It appears that initially holders of the VC and GC were excluded from this issue. After lobbying by the VC and GC Association this decision changed and on 29 April 2002 it was announced by a British Minister that all VC and GC would received the medal, including those in Commonwealth countries. At the time there were three GCs in New Zealand (all ex-British RAF, RN or MN). [REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i);
[REDACTED] s 9(2)(g)(i)
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] The awards were approved.

By 2002 New Zealand had instituted a "VC for New Zealand" and replaced the GC with the New Zealand Cross (NZC). [REDACTED] s 9(2)(f)(i);
[REDACTED] s 9(2)(g)(i)

Neither the Governor-General nor the Prime Minister was offered the Medal.

Queen's Diamond Jubilee Medal 2012

The recent media statement indicates that this medal will be issued all living holders of the VC and GC. The statement does not qualify whether the "VC for New Zealand" (or the "VC for Australia") is included but bearing in mind recipients of both the New Zealand and Australian VCs are members of the VC and GC Association it is almost certain that they will receive it. At present there are two (2) living New Zealand holders of the GC (ex RN and MN). Canada has announced that they will issue a Diamond Jubilee Medal and it is assumed that any Canadian VC or GC will receive that medal.

[REDACTED]

s 9(2)(g)(i)

[REDACTED]

s 9(2)(g)(i)

[REDACTED]

s 9(2)(g)(i)

PERSONAL NOTE

s 9(2)(g)(i); s 9(2)(f)(i)

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

PPO'S
28 July 2011

RELEASED UNDER THE
OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT