

19-D-02509
19-D-02217

Chris Johnston

Dear Chris

Thank you for your email of 30 September 2019 requesting the following under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act):

Dear Ministry for the Environment, Please provide any records (including but not limited to internal/external: documents, emails, notes, minutes, text messages, or social media messages) mentioning scientist Patrick Frank. For context - so that you can correctly identify the individual - some links relevant to his work are mentioned in the links below. 1) This is the peer reviewed paper (published on 6 September 2019) which finds that the statistical techniques used for forecasting global surface air temperature have not used an appropriate error propagation technique - and are therefore unreliable forecasts for the IPCC or governments to be using for policy [sic] decisions.
<https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/feart.2019.00223/full> or
<https://t.co/tdnQhjzDCS?amp=1> 2) This is Patrick Frank's blog about his paper when it was published - which was rather scathing and impolite.
<https://wattsupwiththat.com/2019/09/07/propagation-of-error-and-the-reliability-of-global-air-temperature-projections-mark-ii/> or <https://t.co/VxX54HJh7f?amp=1>

This response has also taken into consideration the following points you have raised in your follow up request of 04 November 2019:

1) Combined response - I asked for responses to be separate. Combining the responses makes it harder to establish whether the question has been answered. Please do not combine your responses to separate requests. It frustrates the requester and those people that may access this OIA request at a later date.

*2) Excluding responses to the Select Committee that are publicly available. If you follow this link you will discover that the Parliamentary Select Committee web page is only searchable by keyword of the author - and not content. Therefore I cannot even find submissions that I know are there by searching for keywords included in the text. For example:
<https://www.parliament.nz/en/pb/sc/submissions-and-advice/?criteria.Keyword=nikolov&criteria.Author=Environment+Committee&criteria.ParliamentNumber=-1&criteria.Timeframe=&criteria.DateFrom=&criteria.DateTo=>*

3) Information in previous OIAs excluded - I have previously submitted an OIA but records mentioned in that OIA were not included in this one. <https://fyi.org.nz/request/9425-all-documents-mentioning-climate-scientists-nikolov-and-or-zeller>

The Ministry for the Environment has identified one document in scope of your request, as listed in the attached table. Some information within this document has been withheld under the following sections of the Act:

9(2)(a) to protect the privacy of natural persons

In terms of section 9(1) of the Act, I am satisfied that, in the circumstances, the withholding of this information is not outweighed by other considerations that render it desirable to make the information available in the public interest.

I acknowledge the concerns with our initial response to your request. We have split the response back into the three individual requests.

You have the right to seek an investigation and review by the Office of the Ombudsman of my decision to withhold information relating to this request, in accordance with section 28(3) of the Act. The relevant details can be found on their website at: www.ombudsman.parliament.nz.

Please note that due to the public interest in our work the Ministry for the Environment publishes responses to requests for official information on our [OIA responses page](#) shortly after the response has been sent.

If you have any queries about this, please feel free to contact our Executive Relations team.

Yours sincerely



R.L.

Roger Lincoln
Director, Climate Change

List of documents

No.	Date	Content	Decision	OIA Section/s applied
1	1 August 2016	Ministerial: FW_16_1415_MORE ABOUT FINDING TRUE TEMPERATURE	Release in part	S9(2)(a)

