

11 March 2020

Mr Brian Warburton
fyi-request-12245-240fe31d@requests.fyi.org.nz

REF: OIA-6409

Dear Brian

Request made under the Official Information Act 1982

Thank you for your email of Saturday 15 February 2020 requesting the following information under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act):

1. *Benefit/Cost Ratio – please provide details of the*
 - a) *the benefit/cost ratio as determined by NZTA for the Transmission Gully Project when it was first designated in 1999;*
 - b) *the benefit/cost ratio as determined by NZTA for the Transmission Gully Project when it was subsequently re-designated in 2012;*
 - c) *the benefit/cost ratio as determined by NZTA for the Transmission Gully Project immediately prior to the recent reassessment announced mid-February 2020) of the transport funds required to complete the project; and,*
 - d) *the benefit/cost ratio as determined by NZTA for the Transmission Gully Project after its recent reassessment (announced mid-February 2020) of the transport funds required to complete the project (i.e.: after the incorporation of an additional \$190M to the cost of the project).*

2. *Variance*

Please provide me with sufficient information so I am to understand:

if, in respect of 1c and 1d, there is a variance of more than 5% between the cost of the project what the reasons are for that variance; and,

if, in respect of 1c and 1d, there is a variance of more than 5% between the benefits of the project what the reasons are for that variance.

Regarding your specific requests for details on the benefit/cost ratio (BCR) as determined by Waka Kotahi NZ Transport Agency for the Transmission Gully Project, our responses are as follows:

1(a) – We have reviewed historic records, despite reasonable and considerable efforts to try and locate a document that identifies the benefit/cost ratio for Transmission Gully when the Notice of Requirement was lodged in 1996 and/or designated following appeal in 2003. We have been unable to locate any document(s) containing the information requested, therefore your request is being refused pursuant to section 18(e) of the Act on the basis that the document(s) containing the information requested cannot be found, despite reasonable efforts to locate them.

1(b) – The Transport Agency stated in evidence to the Board of Inquiry hearing in 2012 for the Transmission Gully motorway that the BCR for Transmission Gully was 0.82, excluding agglomeration benefits.

That BCR is contained in a brief of evidence available at the following website, covered in pages 97 to 106:

<https://www.nzta.govt.nz/assets/projects/transmission-gully-application/docs/evidence-craig-nicholson.pdf>

In 2013, the BCR for the Wellington Northern Corridor was recalculated as part of an addendum to the Business Case for the Wellington Northern Corridor. The BCR for the Wellington Northern Corridor was 1.6 including agglomeration benefits, but without wider economic impacts and 1.8 including wider economic impacts. The benefits and costs of the Transmission Gully project are included within the corridor BCR. The calculated Transmission Gully Project BCR at that time was 1.5 as a stand-alone project.

A copy of the updated Wellington Northern Corridor Business Case: 2013 Addendum is available at <https://www.nzta.govt.nz/assets/Uploads/wnc-business-case-addendum-full-report-2013.pdf>

In response to your requests numbered, 1(c), 1(d) and 2, the BCR for Transmission Gully has not been recalculated since 2013. These requests are therefore refused pursuant to section 18(e) of Act on the basis that the information requested does not exist.

Under section 28 of the Act, you have the right to ask the Ombudsman to review my decision to refuse parts of your request. The contact details for the Ombudsman can be located at www.ombudsman.parliament.nz.

If you would like to discuss this reply further with the Transport Agency, please contact Craig Nicholson – Principal Project Manager Transmission Gully, by email to craig.nicholson@nzta.govt.nz or by phone on (04) 910 8183.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Tony Fisher', enclosed in a simple oval shape.

Tony Fisher
Acting Senior Manager, Project Delivery