

Expert Examiner Assessment Form

Protected Objects Act 1975



The following object(s) is/are to be assessed in accordance with sections 2 and 7A to 7D of the Protected Objects Act 1975:

George Cross (GC) awarded to Sgt Stewart Guthrie of NZ Police, posthumously in 1991.

Examples of the George Cross Medal are protected New Zealand objects under the 'Numismatic and philatelic' category of protected objects in Schedule 4 of the Act.

The export application is enclosed with this document.

Date Opinion Requested: 27 November 2017

Date Opinion Completed: 14 December 2017

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT

The purpose of this recommendation is to provide the Chief Executive of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage with advice under the Protected Objects Act 1975. The decision to permit or refuse export can be made only by the Chief Executive of the Ministry.

All information provided in this form by the expert examiner is for the Chief Executive's responsibilities under the Act and shall be used by the Chief Executive as he sees fit.

EXPERT ADVICE

Section One: Protected New Zealand Object

1. Is the object of importance to New Zealand, or to a part of New Zealand, for one or more of the following reasons: *(tick all the boxes that apply)*

- aesthetic
- archaeological
- architectural
- artistic
- cultural
- historical

- literary
- scientific
- social
- spiritual
- technological
- traditional

2. Does the object fall within one or more of the categories of protected objects set out in Schedule 4 of the Protected Objects Act 1975? *(tick all the boxes that apply)*

- Archaeological, ethnographic, and historical objects of non-New Zealand origin, relating to New Zealand
- Art objects including fine, decorative, and popular art
- Documentary heritage objects
- Taonga Tūturu
- Natural science objects
- New Zealand archaeological objects
- Numismatic and philatelic objects
- Science, technology, industry, economy, and transport objects
- Social history objects

3. Please explain your reasoning for ticking none or one or more of the boxes in questions 1 and 2:

Sergeant Stewart Guthrie's George Cross medal is of historical importance to New Zealand and is intrinsically connected to the mass shootings at Aramoana in 1990 in which 13 people died including Sergeant Guthrie. Police Sergeant Guthrie is New Zealand's only civilian recipient of the George Cross.

In terms of the categories of protected objects set out in Schedule 4 of the Protected Objects Act 1975, 7 (2d) specifically mentions examples of George Cross medals. Stewart Guthrie's George Cross medal is one of three awarded to New Zealanders out of approximately 408 awarded in total. The George Cross is the second highest award in the United Kingdom's honours system and is awarded for acts of heroism or courage in circumstances of extreme danger but not in a war situation. New Zealand introduced its own bravery honours system in 1999 and the George Cross award was replaced by the New Zealand Cross, this country's highest award for civilian bravery.

The purpose of this recommendation is to provide the Chief Executive of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage with advice under the Protected Objects Act 1975. The decision to permit or refuse export can be made only by the Chief Executive of the Ministry.

All information provided in this form by the expert examiner is for the Chief Executive's responsibilities under the Act and shall be used by the Chief Executive as he sees fit.

If you have ticked one or more boxes in questions 1 *and* 2, it is your advice that the object is a protected New Zealand object.

4. Is the object a protected New Zealand object?

- Yes (go to Section Two: Export of the Protected New Zealand Object)
 No (go to Section Four: Resources used in Making Recommendation)

Section Two: Export of the Protected New Zealand Object

This section is to be completed only if the object is a protected New Zealand object.

5. Is the object: (tick all the boxes that apply)

- substantially physically authentic and made or naturally occurring in New Zealand?
 substantially physically authentic and made with New Zealand materials?
 substantially physically authentic and used by New Zealanders?
 substantially physically authentic and related to New Zealand?

Please explain your reasoning:

The object appears to be physically authentic and in excellent condition. While produced in the United Kingdom the object is related to New Zealand through being awarded posthumously to New Zealander Stuart Guthrie for his bravery during the tragedy at Aramoana in 1990, New Zealand's worst mass murder.

6. Is the object: (tick all the boxes that apply)

- associated with, or representative of, activities, events, ideas, movements, objects, persons, or places of importance to New Zealand?
 important to New Zealand for its technical accomplishment or design, artistic excellence, or symbolic, commemorative, or research value?
 part of a wider historical, scientific, or cultural collection or assemblage of importance to New Zealand?

Please explain your reasoning:

While the object is naturally of most significance to the surviving members of Stuart Guthrie's family, it has importance to New Zealanders as symbolic recognition of the courage and sacrifice made by Guthrie while responding to a horrific event.

The purpose of this recommendation is to provide the Chief Executive of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage with advice under the Protected Objects Act 1975. The decision to permit or refuse export can be made only by the Chief Executive of the Ministry.

All information provided in this form by the expert examiner is for the Chief Executive's responsibilities under the Act and shall be used by the Chief Executive as he sees fit.

7. Is the object is of such significance to New Zealand or part of New Zealand that its export from New Zealand would substantially diminish New Zealand's cultural heritage?

- Yes
 No

Please explain your reasoning:

Stewart Guthrie's George Cross medal is one of three awarded to New Zealanders. Both of the other two medals (Lance Corporal David Russell 1948 and Sergeant Ken Hudson, 1974) are held by the National Army Museum at Waiouru where they are viewable.

At present Stewart Guthrie's medal is held privately by his family and is not available for viewing by the New Zealand public. Given that the family would like to sell the medal and its probable high value, it is unlikely to end up in a public institution. It is preferable for the medal to go to an international museum rather than a private collection.

It is proposed by the Guthrie family that the George Cross medal is sold to Lord Ashcroft so that it can be added to his permanently displayed collection at the Imperial War Museum in London.

The export of Stewart Guthrie's medal to the Lord Ashcroft collection at the Imperial War Museum will allow the medal to be publicly displayed to a large audience including New Zealanders. In addition Stewart Guthrie's bravery will be internationally recognised alongside the stories of the 241 Victoria Cross and George Cross medals from the United Kingdom and the Commonwealth already displayed in the Lord Ashcroft Gallery. The gallery will be able to provide an international context which would not be possible in a New Zealand setting.

The export of the medal to an international museum does not preclude the medal returning to New Zealand on a temporary basis for display.

Section Three: Recommendation to the Chief Executive

You must recommend that export permission be refused if you ticked "yes" in question 7

8. The recommendation under sections 7A to 7D of the Protected Objects Act is for the Chief Executive of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage to:

- Approve Export Permission
 Refuse Export Permission

9. If you recommended that export permission be approved, please state any conditions that you think should be imposed on the export.

That the medal is sold to Lord Ashcroft for his collection and placed on display at the Imperial War Museum.

The purpose of this recommendation is to provide the Chief Executive of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage with advice under the Protected Objects Act 1975. The decision to permit or refuse export can be made only by the Chief Executive of the Ministry.

All information provided in this form by the expert examiner is for the Chief Executive's responsibilities under the Act and shall be used by the Chief Executive as he sees fit.

Section Four: Resources Used in Making Recommendation

10. Please list any publications, catalogues, research or people who significantly influenced your decision:

British Commonwealth Gallantry, Meritorious and Distinguished Service Awards – The George Cross and George Medal, New Zealand Defence Force Medals Site:

<http://medals.nzdf.mil.nz/category/i/i1.html>

Imperial War Museum Press Release: The Lord Ashcroft Gallery, Extraordinary Heroes opens 12 November 2010.

Information on George Cross recipients:

[https://ipfs.io/ipfs/QmXoypizjW3WknFIJnKLwHCnL72vedxiQkDDP1mXWo6uco/wiki/George Cross.html](https://ipfs.io/ipfs/QmXoypizjW3WknFIJnKLwHCnL72vedxiQkDDP1mXWo6uco/wiki/George%20Cross.html)

Waiouru Army Museum's Information on the George Cross:

[https://www.armymuseum.co.nz/pdf/The George Cross BIO.pdf](https://www.armymuseum.co.nz/pdf/The%20George%20Cross%20BIO.pdf)

George Cross, The Encyclopaedia of New Zealand, 1966:

<https://teara.govt.nz/en/1966/george-cross>

The War Medals that have Soared in Value:

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/finance/personalfinance/investing/11280125/The-war-medals-that-have-soared-in-value.html>

Lord Ashcroft Gallery, Imperial War Museum:

<http://www.iwm.org.uk/exhibitions/iwm-london/lord-ashcroft-gallery>

Section Five: Declaration

I declare that I provided advice to the Chief Executive of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage in good faith and have considered sections 7A to 7D of the Protected Objects Act in coming to my recommendation.

Signature and Name

14/12/2017

Date

This recommendation has by authorised by

15 December 2017

Signature

Position

The purpose of this recommendation is to provide the Chief Executive of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage with advice under the Protected Objects Act 1975. The decision to permit or refuse export can be made only by the Chief Executive of the Ministry.

All information provided in this form by the expert examiner is for the Chief Executive's responsibilities under the Act and shall be used by the Chief Executive as he sees fit.