

2018 Census External Data Quality Panel: Minutes of Meeting on 9 November 2018

Date and time	9 November 2018, 9am to 3:30pm
Location	Stats NZ, Auckland Office 48 Greys Avenue, Auckland Central
Present - panel members	Richard Bedford - Chair Tahu Kukutai (via audio conference from about 11am) Donna Cormack Alison Reid Thomas Lumley Len Cook Barry Milne Ian Cope (in person)
Present – Stats NZ	<u>Auckland</u> Kathy Connolly, General Manager Census Vince Galvin, Chief Methodologist Gareth Meech, Senior Manager Census Customer Focus and Secretariat Steph Prosser, Senior Analyst Census Adele Quinn, Manager Census Analytics Christine Bycroft, Principal Statistician <u>Christchurch via v/c for selected sessions</u> Chris Hodgins, Manager Census Geography project Alex Bayley, Senior Manager Census Respondent Focus
Meeting minutes	<p>9-10am – In-committee meeting and feedback</p> <p>The Chair reported back that the level of detail in the draft minutes from the 2nd meeting is better than the first meeting and is a good model for the subsequent minutes. One change was suggested by a panel member in regards to the sentence around going back into the field and once draft changes were made, the Chair accepted the minutes as approved. The action points list was revisited before the body of the meeting started and this has been updated at the end of these minutes. The Chair agreed to work with the secretariat to confirm which actions could be closed in the week of 12 November.</p> <p>The Chair reported that the panel had discussed the legal obligations of Stats NZ to the collection and publication of accurate census data. The panel wants assurance from Stats NZ that procedures/methodologies to improve the quality of census data are legal in the context of legislation including Stats Act, Electoral Act and Privacy Act. The panel needs to know they are giving advice that does not breach the requirements of any act or any commitments that have already been made. The panel strongly recommended that suitable advice is sought by Stats NZ that informs the panel.</p> <p>The panel also discussed a draft proposal for the content of their report that had been circulated to panel members prior to the meeting. The Chair will send a copy of a revised version of this proposal to the secretariat and Kathy and this will become the working draft that will help determine the priority of information and data the panel need to complete the report.</p>

The Chair noted that the panel will soon need to have additional meetings to start forming and writing their independent report. The Chair will suggest additional dates and times prior to the December meeting.

The secretariat advised that a solution for allowing panel members access to presentations, papers and data prior to meetings has been approved and will hopefully be in place by 16 November. As previously advised, all panel members will need RealMe usernames to access the solution.

AP3-1: Each panel member to ensure they have a functioning RealMe username by 23 November.

A set of guidelines to access the system and set expectations on how workspace members should work to reduce risk of the data being shared will be developed.

AP3-2: The secretariat to develop and distribute guidelines when the file sharing solution is in place.

The Chair requested that panel members and Stats NZ people hold both 13 and 14 February and 5 and 6 March for the dates of the February and March meetings respectively. The Chair is working with the 2018 Census external reviewers to set up a date to share findings in February and some panel members need more time to confirm the March dates.

AP3-3: The secretariat and Chair to agree and distribute future meeting dates by 23 November.

Progress on actions from the meeting on 23 October was summarised verbally and details are documented in the new action log at the end of these minutes.

AP3-4: Correct minutes from 23 Oct meeting adding a note to the sentence 'that we could test the model accuracy' in addition to collecting more data from respondents.

10:15am to 3pm – Imputation approach and updated data, Christine and Adele

Stats NZ presented many but not all of the slides prepared for the meeting because of time constraints. The slides and discussion covered:

- a summary of the problems we are facing
- constraints
- presentation of national and regional level data on Māori ethnicity, Māori descent and iwi counts
- dwelling frame quality metrics
- mitigations for non-response adjustment – specifically use of administrative data sources and imputation methods
- programme timelines and
- options to going back into the field.

We had also planned to discuss the quality assurance framework, recent customer engagement and update the panel on the progress and issues faced by the Post Enumeration Survey (but we ran out of time).

In the discussion that accompanied the Stats NZ presentation, Panel members made a number of requests for further information to be provided at subsequent meetings. These requests are itemised below as specific action points.

AP3-5: More information about what which administrative data sources are to be used and whether their use in this context is what respondents and data suppliers would expect - or have been advised. The term IDI is used but this is de-identified data and we are linking using identified data. Is this described in the Privacy Impact Assessment and what do our data providers (both source and intermediaries understand about this particular use). Gareth to add this item to agenda for December meeting.

AP3-6: Check the table stating the percentage of the IDI_ERP using different admin sources. Data does not look right. Christine to check and get back to panel in week of 23 November.

Note that there are (at least) two different stories about Māori ethnic group response rates in Northland compared to Auckland and that Stats will need good analysis to tell the data story.

AP3-7: More information needed about the sources and component of admin data used to help fill gaps in Māori descent data. Christine to check and get back to panel in week of 23 November.

Note that concerns were raised about the lack of other admin sources of iwi data and in particular new iwi added to the classification since the 2013 Census. There was a brief discussion about the impact on users of this data in particular for Treaty settlement processes. Comprehensive engagement will be needed with iwi.

AP3-8: For future data presentations, request that any data created to Territorial Authority level, that we include Auckland Local Boards. Gareth to note for future meetings.

Chris Hodgins joined the conference and presented slides on the dwelling frame quality. There was a lot of information displayed, so panel members will need time to review it once it can be uploaded into sharepoint.

AP3-9: More information needed about the sub-types of Non-Private Dwellings (NPDs). Gareth to check when this detail will be available for the panel and add to sharepoint folder when ready. By end of Dec.

A session on data mitigations was presented by Christine. There was recap of the strategies planned and how Stats is progressing towards implementation.

Panel led a set of questions about the reference to the IDI in our methods and made the point that the IDI is a de-identified research dataset – whereas we are using a set of data from the IDI that initially uses identifying information to link individuals (before being de-identified for census dataset use).

AP3-10: Clarification is needed about what data is used in the census administration enumeration (referred to as IDI data in the presentation) and a list of the current variables being imputed, where the data comes from, whether the data suppliers are aware of its use and whether it uses identifiable or de-identified person data. Christine and Kathy to provide information to panel in time for the Dec meeting.

Kathy then led a discussion about the timelines the programme is working towards. Stats will be updating customers by mid-December about the first release dates. The panel made several suggestions including whether and when an ERP could be produced that was 'informed by the census'.

Engagement with iwi and Māori was discussed. This census could/should be the catalyst for a forward looking discussion on how to produce robust iwi and Māori data across the Official Statistics System (OSS). Some of the panel members suggested that Stats should engage strategic public relations support for this period. Other members emphasized the need for Stats NZ to be as open, transparent and proactive as possible in their communications.

AP3-11: The present criteria about the thresholds being used to make decisions about methods was requested. Gareth to work with Christine to update quality assurance framework presentation that was not able to be presented due to a lack of time today.

Alex Bayley joined the meeting via video conference to discuss options that have been drafted about going back into the field. The panel asked questions and talked about possible pros and cons to each idea. Options to improve Māori and iwi data was discussed including the possible use of iwi held registers.

AP3-12: Panel members to think further about going back into the field and whether they had any further advice for us (as they didn't think they had time to appropriately digest and respond at the meeting). Richard to summarise before December meeting.

There was not time for the presentations on the quality assurance framework, the recent key customer engagement and PES update – due to the need to prioritise the data and methods discussions.

3pm to 3:30 Summary and December meeting priorities

The Chair opened a discussion on what areas would be priorities for the December meeting.

These included:

- Presentation of the messages to be used in the update to the public in early December
- Communication messages that the panel could use
- Quality assurance framework and customer feedback
- PES update
- Updated data shown to date eg (people and dwelling counts, ethnicity, Māori descent and)
- A realistic programme plan and timeline
- Present data on the birthplace data (and include 2013 and 2018 comparisons and IDI-ERP birthplace)
- Present data on gender (sex) and the intersex paper option that was available

AP3-13: Chair to agree priority of topics for Dec meeting by 23 November.

The next meetings dates are:

- 7 December, Auckland
- 13 and/or 14 February, Wellington
- 5 and/or 6 March, Auckland
- April date to be confirmed by 23 Nov.

- May and later dates to be confirmed at 7 Dec meeting.

Action log

Ref	Date raised	Description	Owner	Date required	Progress	Date closed
AP 1-1	29/8/18	TOR: Amend section of report where it states that the GS will sign off on the panel report. Include reference that advice on admin data is wanted - make this more explicit. - Add line to TOR around statutory requirements. - Add line to TOR around impacts of census data on iwi and Māori.	Gareth and Richard B	Before Oct meeting	23/10 TOR was finalised, distributed, reviewed and published 14 Sept. Can be closed.	Closed 14/9/18
AP 1-2	29/8/18	Send independent ABS report to members.	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 ABS report not yet sent given the information is sensitive. Gareth to work with Kathy and Richard on how to give access or present at future meeting. Update at Nov meeting 9/11. Paper will be added to sharepoint folder once up and running. To close before Dec meeting. 6/12 Added to workspace/Shared Documents	Close
AP 1-3	29/8/18	Set up some time to talk in next meeting to talk about electoral legislation and how it's calculated - and prepare something to send out.	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 Links to electoral calculation added to Oct meeting agenda. Electoral data update delivered in Oct meeting.	Closed 23/10/18
AP 1-4	29/8/18	Create and send out template for conflicts of interest.	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 No existing template, but discussion at Oct meeting has led to AP 2-2 – to create a register. Will close this one.	Closed 23/10/18
AP 1-5	29/8/18	Give information on how respondents were to meet their legal obligations.	Gareth	Before or at Oct meeting	23/10 Adele has prepared some information, to be discussed at the informal meeting on 30 Oct. 9/11 Short paper printed and added to pack at meeting. Additional paper SNZ presented to conference to be added to sharepoint. 6/12 Added to workspace/Shared Documents	Close
AP 1-6	29/8/18	Complete declaration of secrecy docs for Tahu and Ian	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 Ian and Tahu signed declarations at the Oct meeting. Close	Closed 23/10/18
AP 1-7	29/8/18	Confirm dates of next meetings.	Richard	At Oct meeting	23/10 Nov, Dec, Feb and Mar dates confirmed. April date to be confirmed. Leave open 9/11 Feb and March dates will likely include additional meetings to work on panel report and meet with external review team.	Open

AP 1-8	29/8/18	Collate and send out information about languages (what was considered & priorities).	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 Summary not provided at Oct meeting. Will target Nov meeting. 9/11 Some information was provided with the October agenda. To be added to Sharepoint folder before Dec meeting. Additional information wanted on how the languages were selected. 6/12 Added to shared folder	Open Close
AP 1-9	29/8/18	Find out the response rate of the PES	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 Ran out of time for PES update. To be prioritised in next 2 meetings. 9/11 Ran out of time at 9 Nov meeting, but will be added to later meeting date. 6/12 PES added to agenda for Dec meeting	Open /Close
AP 1-10	29/8/18	Find out the methodology of the independent agency that measured the 'awareness' KPI.	Richard S	Before Oct meeting	23/10 Summary of information attached to October meeting agenda.	Closed 23/10/18
AP 1-11	29/8/18	Prepare information for critical triggers.	Gareth	Before Nov meeting	23/10 Not specifically discussed at meeting. Gareth to discuss whether this fits with the panel or better with the external review and advise panel. 9/11 Richard will work with the external reviewers on what the panel will or not need to produce their findings. Close	Closed 9/11
AP 1-12	29/8/18	Provide information of bias.	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 presentation of method and the pro and cons of approaches only touched on at Oct meeting. This will be subject to Nov meeting content. To close after that meeting 9/11 Some information about bias was discussed as part of the mitigations sessions. Close	Closed 9/11
AP 1-13	29/8/18	Provide rough indication of Māori response rates for next meeting.	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 Māori descent and ethnicity counts presented at October meeting. Will be subject to future discussions, but will close this action point.	Closed 23/10/18
Meeting 2 actions						
AP 2-0	23/10/18	Revise minutes from the first meeting and present to for confirmation at the meeting on 9 November.	Richard and Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed by 23 Nov.	Open
AP 2-1	23/10/18	Work out way to give access to sensitive information outside of the meeting room	Kathy and Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 DIA Sharepoint solution approved, but not yet implemented. Target date 16 November. 6/12 Sharepoint solution created and access given to panel members	Open Close
AP 2-2	23/10/18	Create and distribute a conflict of interest register	Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed and added to Sharepoint before Dec meeting.	Open

					6/12 Added to Sharepoint/Shared Documents – 7/12 Leave action open for panel members to fill in prior to Feb 2019 meeting	
AP 2-3	23/10/18	More information requested about the components and quality of the dwelling frame including mail-out and list leave approaches, what was added and deleted during operations.	Gareth	At 9 Nov meeting	Topic for 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 Presented on at Nov meeting. Close.	Closed 9/11/18
AP 2-4	23/10/18	More information requested about what investigations we are doing into 2013 counts and response rates – are we assuming that 2013 is correct?	Gareth	By Dec meeting	9/11 Information presented that include 2013 response rates and counts. Gareth to check with Richard whether this should be closed by 23 Nov. 6/12 Gareth to talk to Richard	Open
AP 2-5	23/10/18	Send apartment strategies (and other targeted strategies) as background to next meeting.	Gareth and Steph	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed and added to Sharepoint before Dec meeting. 6/12 2018 Census Targeted area slides added to workspace	Open Close
AP 2-6	23/10/18	Need more detail about the totality and components of the imputation methods initially planned and now being implemented.	Gareth and Richard	By 9 Nov	Sessions at 30 Oct meeting and priority at full 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 Information presented at meeting. Gareth to check with Richard whether this should be closed by 23 Nov. 6/12 Gareth to talk to Richard	Open
AP 2-7	23/10/18	Next time data is presented, include like for like comparisons between ERPs and Census usual resident counts – we have used 2013 census usual residence counts and 2018 ERP as benchmarks in same tables.	Gareth and Adele	For Nov meeting	25/10 – Will note for future meetings	Closed 25/10
AP 2-8	23/10/18	Next time maps are produced, try to use the same colours and more detailed response rate breakdowns. Also ensure future TA breakdowns include Auckland Local Boards in future.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	25/10 – Will note for future meetings	Closed 25/10
AP 2-9	23/10/18	Ensure labels on all graphs are clear and any footnotes noted with graphs. To note for next meetings.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	25/10 – Will note for future meetings	Closed 25/10
AP 2-10	23/10/18	Request for data on birthplace.	Gareth	By Dec meeting	Topic for December meeting 9/11 To be presented at Dec meeting. 7/12 Data added to workspace by 7 Dec	Open
AP 2-11	23/10/18	Discussion needed about the decisions to impute a larger range of variables and impact on not stated. Include ethnicity and Māori descent.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 30 Oct meeting and then at 9 Nov meeting 9/11 (Not final) Māori descent, ethnicity and iwi data presented at meeting. Close	Closed 9/11/18

AP 2-12	23/10/18	Send summary table and links to Census Transformation papers (in SNZ archive site) as background to next meeting.	Gareth	For 9 Nov pre reading	9/11 Email sent in week before Nov meeting. Close	Closed 9/11/18
AP 2-13	23/10/18	More information needed about IDI household matching including whether there will be any more specific targeting of areas with the threshold cut-offs (have we considered using different cut-off rules for different parts of the population?).	Christine	By 9 Nov	9/11 Presentation on mitigation including imputations completed at Nov meeting. Gareth to talk with Richard about whether this should stay open. 6/12 Gareth to talk to Richard after dec meeting	Open
AP 2-14	23/10/18	Stats NZ needs to consider the public perception of the extended use of admin data and use of name and address to match to admin sources of personal information. Kathy to action and respond back before 9 Nov.	Kathy	By 9 Nov	9/11 Discussion at Nov meeting has led to additional need for information and new action point 3-10. Close.	Closed 11/9/18
AP 2-15	23/10/18	Require more information about the qualities of the ethnicity data in the IDI-ERP.	Christine	By 9 Nov	Pre reading to be sent and Christine to discuss at 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 Email with links sent prior to Nov meeting and additional info presented on 9/11. Close.	Closed 9/11/18
AP 2-16	23/10/18	Re electoral implications, more information is required about the representativeness of the data and impacts of imputations. A range of scenarios, including constitutional impacts for Māori, would be useful	Kathy and Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 No additional electoral data was presented (as not complete yet). Updated draft electoral calculations to be presented to panel in Dec meeting. 6/12 Electoral data has not yet been run – targeting Feb meeting update.	Open
AP 2-17	23/10/18	Request for more information about Plan C in advance of next meeting. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and agree priority with Richard.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 Presented to Nov meeting. Close.	Closed 9/11/18
AP 2-18	23/10/18	Need more information about the Post Enumeration Survey methods and outcomes under the different imputation scenarios.	Kathy and Brooke	By Dec meeting	Topic for December meeting. 9/11 PES to be included in Dec meeting agenda. 6/12 added to agenda	Open Close
AP 2-19	23/10/18	Only some panel members are available to go to Chch on the 30 th . Confirm Ian, Len, Thomas and Barry will be going. Gareth to arrange travel with the four.	Gareth	By 26 Oct	25/10 Travel being booked by Brenda	Closed 26 Oct
Meeting 3 actions						
AP 3-1	9/11/18	Each panel member to ensure they have a functioning RealMe username.	Panel members	By 23 Nov	6/12 Panel members to update	Open Close
AP 3-2	9/11/18	Develop and distribute guidelines when file sharing solution is in place	Gareth	By 23 Nov	6/12 Brief guidelines provided via email	Open Close

AP 3-3	9/11/18	Agree and distribute future meeting dates by 23 November	Richard and Gareth	By 23 Nov	6/12 Check with Richard	Open
AP 3-4	9/11/18	Correct minutes from 23 Oct meeting adding a note to the sentence 'that we could test the model accuracy' in addition to collecting more data from respondents.	Gareth	By 23 Nov	6/12 added, new version to be uploaded after Dec meeting.	Open
AP 3-5	9/11/18	More information about what admin data is used in the method and for what purpose. Privacy Impact Assessment update. Add to agenda for December.	Gareth	By 7 Dec	6/12 Did not have time for Dec agenda. Propose to present in Feb.	Open
AP 3-6	9/11/18	Check the table stating the percentage of the IDI_ERP using different admin sources as data does not look right.	Christine	By 7 Dec		Open
AP 3-7	9/11/18	More information needed about the sources and component of admin data used to help fill gaps in Māori descent data.	Christine	23 Nov	6/12 included in Dec presentation	Open
AP 3-8	9/11/18	For future data presentations, request that any data created to Territorial Authority level, that we include Auckland Local Boards.	Gareth	By 7 Dec	6/12 Noted	Open close
AP 3-9	9/11/18	More information needed about the sub-types of Non-Private Dwellings (NPDs). Check when this detail will be available for the panel and add to sharepoint folder when ready.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	6/12 Info not yet available, can target Feb or Mar meeting	Open
AP 3-10	9/11/18	Clarification is needed about what data is used in the census administration enumeration (referred to as IDI data in the presentation), and a list of the current variables being imputed, where it comes from, whether the data suppliers are aware of its use and whether it uses identifiable or de-identified person data.	Christine and Kathy	By 7 Dec	6/12 More info in Dec presentation – Gareth to check with Richard after Dec meeting to see whether can close	Open
AP 3-11	9/11/18	Present criteria about the thresholds being used to make decisions about methods.	Gareth and Christine	By 7 Dec	6/12 Some information in Dec meeting present, more info to come after meeting. Leave open.	Open
AP3-12		Panel members to think further about going back into the field and whether they had any further advice for us (as they didn't think they had time to appropriately digest and respond at the meeting).	Richard	By 7 Dec	6/12 Check with panel about whether there was any more feedback.	Open

AP 3-13	9/11/18	Agree priority of topics for Dec meeting.	Richard	By 23 Nov	Close	Open/Close

Released under the Official Information Act