

2018 Census External Data Quality Panel: Minutes of Meeting on 23 October 2018

Date and time	23 October 2018, 9am to 3:15pm
Location	Stats NZ, Auckland Office 48 Greys Avenue, Auckland Central
Present - panel members	Richard Bedford - Chair Tahu Kukutai Donna Cormack Alison Reid Thomas Lumley Len Cook Barry Milne Ian Cope (in person)
Present – Stats NZ	<u>Auckland</u> Kathy Connolly, General Manager Census Vince Galvin, Chief Methodologist Gareth Meech, Senior Manager Census Customer Focus and Secretariat Steph Prosser, Senior Analyst Census Adele Quinn, Manager Census Analytics Christine Bycroft, Principal Statistician
Meeting minutes	<p>9-10am – In-committee meeting and feedback</p> <p>The Chair reported back on a discussion about the draft minutes from the first meeting. The Panel felt they were too detailed and, although anonymised, comments could be attributed to individuals. In revising the minutes the Panel requested that all action points were numbered and presented in the minutes where the discussion they relate to occurred. Dates for completion and owners of the actions needed to be specified. A summary of actions, with appropriate cross-referencing, needed to be provided at the end of the minutes. The Chair agreed to work with the secretariat to revise these minutes which would be presented to the Panel for confirmation at the meeting on 9 November. Action Point (AP) 2-0.</p> <p>The Panel had agreed that minutes of the meetings should capture in a brief summary the essence of the discussion, the issues raised and actions requested/approved. The Chair noted that if Panel members wanted a specific item of discussion or point to be recorded in the minutes then this needed to be noted at the time during the meeting.</p> <p>On behalf of the Panel, the Chair requested that all written or tabular material provided by Stats NZ to the Panel includes the date the material was provided and is version-controlled.</p> <p>The Chair also advised the meeting that there had been a conversation about written information and powerpoint presentations that were supplied in meetings but which had to be returned at the end of the meeting. The Panel is concerned that without papers to read before the meeting, and not being able to take notes home with them, limited their ability to be effective. AP 2-1: Gareth and Kathy to work out way to give access to sensitive information outside of the meeting room.</p>

The Chair reported he been introduced to the two external reviewers who had recently been appointed to undertake a comprehensive assessment of the operation of the 2018 Census. The Panel Chair and reviewers will keep the other party updated on progress with their respective tasks. It is likely that there will be a joint meeting of the Panel and the reviewers in February 2019. The Chair noted that the reviewers had requested that if individual Panel members wish to engage with them they should do this through the Panel Chair.

With regard to Panel members getting more operational information about what went well and didn't go well during execution of the census, an optional meeting in Christchurch on 30 October with some of the operational experts had been arranged. Panel members Len Cook, Ian Cope, Thomas Lumley and Barry Milne will attend this meeting. A further meeting with operations staff will be arranged early in the new year.

Progress on actions from the meeting on 23 October was summarised verbally and details are documented in the new action log at the end of these minutes.

Changes to conflict of interest

No new conflicts were raised at the meeting, but it was requested that a formal register is created for the Panel to access at each meeting. **AP 2-2:** Gareth to create and distribute a conflict of interest register before the meeting on 9 November.

10:30am to 3pm– Data presentation and electoral update by Kathy, Vince, Christine and Adele

Stats NZ presented many but not all of the slides prepared for the meeting because of time constraints. The slides covered overall response rates (discussed briefly at the meeting on 23 October), more detail about the missing groups with particular reference to ethnicity and geographic area, counts (with maps) by region, TA and SA2, summary counts by key demographic variables, and a description of administrative data sources.

Imputation strategies were introduced briefly along with some implications of undercounting for delivery of data required by legislation for the determination of electoral boundaries and the numbers of seats for Māori registered on the Māori Electoral Roll.

In the discussion that accompanied the Stats NZ presentation, Panel members made a number of requests for further information to be provided at subsequent meetings. These requests are itemised below as specific action points.

AP2-3: More information about the components and quality of the dwelling frame including mail-out and list leave approaches, what was added and deleted during operations. Gareth to arrange for this information to be provided for the meeting on 9 November.

AP2-4: More information about investigations into the reliability of 2013 counts and response rates that are being used as reference points for the 2018 census data. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

AP2-5: Send details of strategies for addressing target groups, including apartments, as background material for the next meeting. Gareth to collate and send to Panel members prior to 9 Nov meeting.

AP2-6: More detail about the totality and components of the imputation methods initially planned and now being implemented was requested. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

AP2-7: Next time data is presented, include like for like comparisons between ERPs and Census usually resident counts – we have used 2013 census usual residence counts and 2018 ERP as benchmarks in same tables. Gareth to note for subsequent meetings.

AP2-8: Next time maps are produced, try to use consistent colours and scales. Also would like to see similar response rate data for Auckland Local Boards. Gareth to note for subsequent meetings.

AP2-9: Ensure labels on all graphs are clear and any footnotes noted with graphs. Gareth to note for subsequent meetings.

AP2-10: Request for data on birthplace of the population in 2018. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

AP2-11: Discussion needed about the decisions to impute data for a larger range of variables and to remove the 'not stated' category in some key ones like ethnicity. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

AP2-12: Send summary table and links to Census Transformation papers (in SNZ archive site) as background information for the next meeting. Gareth to follow up for meeting on 9 Nov.

AP2-13: More information needed about IDI household matching including whether there will be any more specific targeting of areas with the threshold cut-offs (have we considered using different cut-off rules for different parts of the population?). Gareth to assign SNZ owner and get information sent out before 9 Nov.

AP2-14: Stats NZ needs to consider the public perception of the extended use of admin data and use of name, age and address to match to admin sources of personal information. Kathy to action and respond back before 9 Nov.

AP2-15: Need more information about the quality of the ethnicity data in the IDI-ERP. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

AP2-16: Re electoral implications, more information is required about the representativeness of the data and impacts of imputations. A range of scenarios, including constitutional impacts for Māori, would be useful. Gareth to work out when more information about the electoral data will be available and agree, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

3pm to 3:15 Summary of day

There was not time for the presentation on the quality assurance framework – prioritising the data and methods discussions. There was a detailed discussion about the approaches Stats NZ is taking to improve data quality by extending the intended use of administrative data - referred to as "Plan B". Other strategies to improve census information using the IDI-ERP referred to as "Plan C", were only discussed briefly. This will require more time at a subsequent meeting.

AP2-17: Request for more information about Plan C in advance of next meeting. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed

There was also an interest in talking about customer uses and the date and content of the product releases – including the idea of a possible provisional release.

Kathy introduced the possibility of going back into the field to collect more census data. The Panel questioned whether going back into the field may also help measure the accuracy of our imputation. A preliminary discussion about this will take place at the meeting with Stats NZ staff in Christchurch on 30 October.

AP2-18: Need more information about the Post Enumeration Survey methods and outcomes under the different imputation scenarios. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

AP2-19: Gareth to arrange travel to Christchurch for Len, Ian, Thomas and Barry by 26 Oct.

AP2-20: The panel said they would like to get a better sense of the roadmap going forward. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed.

AP2-21: Circulate a list of standard releases from the census. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and identify, with Richard, the meeting where this matter can be discussed

The next meetings dates are:

- 9 November, Auckland
- 7 December, Auckland
- 14 February, Wellington
- 6 March, Auckland
- April date to be confirmed by 9 Nov meeting.

Action log

Ref	Date raised	Description	Owner	Date required	Progress	Date closed
AP 1-1	29/8/18	TOR: Amend section of report where it states that the GS will sign off on the panel report. Include reference that advice on admin data is wanted - make this more explicit. - Add line to TOR around statutory requirements. - Add line to TOR around impacts of census data on iwi and Māori.	Gareth and Richard B	Before Oct meeting	23/10 TOR was finalised, distributed, reviewed and published 14 Sept. Can be closed.	Closed 14/9/18
AP 1-2	29/8/18	Send independent ABS report to members.	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 ABS report not yet sent given the information is sensitive. Gareth to work with Kathy and Richard on how to give access or present at future meeting. Update at Nov meeting	Open
AP 1-3	29/8/18	Set up some time to talk in next meeting to talk about electoral legislation and how it's calculated	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 Links to electoral calculation added to Oct meeting agenda. Electoral data update delivered in Oct meeting.	Closed 23/10/18

		- and prepare something to send out.				
AP 1-4	29/8/18	Create and send out template for conflicts of interest.	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 No existing template, but discussion at Oct meeting has led to AP 2-2 – to create a register. Will close this one.	Closed 23/10/18
AP 1-5	29/8/18	Give information on how Stats NZ has met legal obligations.	Gareth	Before or at Oct meeting	23/10 Adele has prepared some information, to be discussed at the informal meeting on 30 Oct.	Open
AP 1-6	29/8/18	Complete declaration of secrecy docs for Tahu and Ian	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 Ian and Tahu signed declarations at the Oct meeting. Close	Closed 23/10/18
AP 1-7	29/8/18	Confirm dates of next meetings.	Richard	At Oct meeting	23/10 Nov, Dec, Feb and Mar dates confirmed. April date to be confirmed. Leave open	Open
AP 1-8	29/8/18	Collate and send out information about languages (what was considered & priorities).	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 Summary not provided at Oct meeting. Will target Nov meeting.	Open
AP 1-9	29/8/18	Find out the response rate of the PES	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 Ran out of time for PES update. To be prioritised in next 2 meetings.	Open
AP 1-10	29/8/18	Find out the methodology of the independent agency that measured the 'awareness' KPI.	Richard S	Before Oct meeting	23/10 Summary of information attached to October meeting agenda.	Closed 23/10/18
AP 1-11	29/8/18	Prepare information for critical triggers.	Gareth	Before Nov meeting	23/10 Not specifically discussed at meeting. Gareth to discuss whether this fits with the panel or better with the external review and advise panel.	Open
AP 1-12	29/8/18	Provide information of bias.	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 presentation of method and the pro and cons of approaches only touched on at Oct meeting. This will be subject to Nov meeting content. To close after that meeting	Open
AP 1-13	29/8/18	Provide rough indication of Māori response rates for next meeting.	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 Māori descent and ethnicity counts presented at October meeting. Will be subject to future discussions, but will close this action point.	Closed 23/10/18
AP 2-0	23/10/18	Revise minutes from the first meeting and present to for confirmation at the meeting on 9 November.	Richard and Gareth	By 9 Nov		Open
AP 2-1	23/10/18	Work out way to give access to sensitive information outside of the meeting room	Kathy and Gareth	By 9 Nov		Open
AP 2-2	23/10/18	Create and distribute a conflict of interest register	Gareth	By 9 Nov		Open
AP 2-3	23/10/18	More information requested about the components and quality of the dwelling frame including mail-out and list leave approaches, what was added and deleted during operations.	Gareth	At 9 Nov meeting	Topic for 9 Nov meeting.	Open
AP 2-4	23/10/18	More information requested about what investigations we are doing into 2013 counts and response rates – are we assuming that 2013 is correct?	Gareth	By Dec meeting		Open

AP 2-5	23/10/18	Send apartment strategies (and other targeted strategies) as background to next meeting.	Gareth and Steph	By 9 Nov		Open
AP 2-6	23/10/18	Need more detail about the totality and components of the imputation methods initially planned and now being implemented.	Gareth and Richard	By 9 Nov	Sessions at 30 Oct meeting and priority at full 9 Nov meeting.	Open
AP 2-7	23/10/18	Next time data is presented, include like for like comparisons between ERPs and Census usually resident counts – we have used 2013 census usual residence counts and 2018 ERP as benchmarks in same tables.	Gareth and Adele	For Nov meeting	25/10 – Will note for future meetings	Closed 25/10
AP 2-8	23/10/18	Next time maps are produced, try to use the same colours and more detailed response rate breakdowns. Also ensure future TA breakdowns include Auckland Local Boards in future.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	25/10 – Will note for future meetings	Closed 25/10
AP 2-9	23/10/18	Ensure labels on all graphs are clear and any footnotes noted with graphs. To note for next meetings.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	25/10 – Will note for future meetings	Closed 25/10
AP 2-10	23/10/18	Request for data on birthplace.	Gareth	By Dec meeting	Topic for December meeting	Open
AP 2-11	23/10/18	Discussion needed about the decisions to impute a larger range of variables and impact on not stated. Include ethnicity and Maori descent.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 30 Oct meeting and then at 9 Nov meeting	Open
AP 2-12	23/10/18	Send summary table and links to Census Transformation papers (in SNZ archive site) as background to next meeting.	Gareth	For 9 Nov pre reading		Open
AP 2-13	23/10/18	More information needed about IDI household matching including whether there will be any more specific targeting of areas with the threshold cut-offs (have we considered using different cut-off rules for different parts of the population?).	Christine	By 9 Nov		Open
AP 2-14	23/10/18	Stats NZ needs to consider the public perception of the extended use of admin data and use of name and address to match to admin sources of personal information. Kathy to action and respond back before 9 Nov.	Kathy	By 9 Nov		Open
AP 2-15	23/10/18	Require more information about the qualities of the ethnicity data in the IDI-ERP.	Christine	By 9 Nov	Pre reading to be sent and Christine to discuss at 9 Nov meeting.	Open
AP 2-16	23/10/18	Re electoral implications, more information is required about the representativeness of the data and impacts of imputations. A	Kathy and Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 9 Nov meeting.	Open

		range of scenarios, including constitutional impacts for Māori, would be useful				
AP 2-17	23/10/18	Request for more information about Plan C in advance of next meeting. Gareth to assign SNZ owner and agree priority with Richard.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 9 Nov meeting.	Open
AP 2-18	23/10/18	Need more information about the Post Enumeration Survey methods and outcomes under the different imputation scenarios.	Kathy and Brooke	By Dec meeting	Topic for December meeting	Open
AP 2-19	23/10/18	Only some panel members are available to go to Chch on the 30 th . Confirm Ian, Len, Thomas and Barry will be going. Gareth to arrange travel with the four.	Gareth	By 26 Oct	25/10 Travel being booked by Brenda	Closed 26 Oct

Released under the Official Information Act