



23 November 2021

Tony Randle
fyi-request-17043-223e267a@requests.fyi.org.nz

REF: OIA-8877

Dear Tony

Request made under the Official Information Act 1982

Thank you for your email of 4 October 2021 requesting the following information under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act):

- 1) *Can I please have a copy of the Terms of Reference for the analysis that has been used to identify the MRT Short-List Options and/or Business Case?*
- 2) *Can I please have a copy of the analysis report on the shortlisting of MRT Long List Options to MRT Medium List Options and on shortlisting to MRT Short List Options and/or Business Case? A copy of all Appendices and any other supporting reports are part of this request.*
- 3) *Can I please have a copy of any presentations to the LGWM Board or governance group on the shortlisting of MRT Long List Options to MRT Medium List Options and on shortlisting to MRT Short List Options and/or Business Case?*
- 4) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed cost calculations for each of the Shortlisted MRT Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option cost figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*
- 5) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed benefit calculations for each of the Shortlisted MRT Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option benefit figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*
- 6) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed patronage calculations for each of the MRT Shortlisted Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option patronage figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*

- 7) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed Multi-Criteria Analysis calculations for each of the Shortlisted MRT Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option Multi-Criteria Analysis figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*
- 8) *Can I please have a copy of the Agenda's, Minutes of any workshops where MRT Option Multi-criteria Analysis was undertaken?*
- 9) *Can I please have a copy of the attendee lists of any workshops where MRT Option Multi-criteria Analysis was undertaken?*
- 10) *Can I please have a copy of the reports and/or presentations provided to attendees of workshops where MRT Option Multi-criteria Analysis was undertaken?*
- 11) *Can I please have a copy of the Terms of Reference for the analysis that has been used to identify the 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Short-List Options and/or Business Case?*
- 12) *Can I please have a copy of the analysis report on the shortlisting of 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Long List Options to 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Medium List Options and on shortlisting to 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Short List Options and/or Business Case? A copy of all Appendices and any other supporting reports are part of this request.*
- 13) *Can I please have a copy of any presentations to the LGWM Board or governance group on the shortlisting of 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Long List Options to 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Medium List Options and on shortlisting to 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Short List Options and/or Business Case?*
- 14) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed cost calculations for each of the Shortlisted 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option cost figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*
- 15) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed benefit calculations for each of the Shortlisted 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option benefit figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*
- 16) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed patronage calculations for each of the 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Shortlisted Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option patronage figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*
- 17) *Can I please have a copy of the detailed Multi-Criteria Analysis calculations for each of the Shortlisted 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Options? For the sake of clarity, I request a copy of the calculation spreadsheet(s) used to provide the option Multi-Criteria Analysis figures in the Shortlist Options Analysis Report and/or Business Case including all formula and other spreadsheet programming.*
- 18) *Can I please have a copy of the Agenda's, Minutes of any workshops where 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Option Multi-criteria Analysis was undertaken?*
- 19) *Can I please have a copy of the attendee lists of any workshops where 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Option Multi-criteria Analysis was undertaken?*
- 20) *Can I please have a copy of the reports and/or presentations provided to attendees of workshops where 2nd Mt Victoria Tunnel Option Multi-criteria Analysis was undertaken?*

The attached document schedule lists the documents in scope of questions 3, 9, 13 and 19. This schedule also indicates where information has been withheld from certain documents.

I am refusing questions 1, 2, 11 and 12 under section 18(d), as the information requested is publicly available in the copies of the following documents that are available on the Let's Get Wellington Moving website:

- Programme Short List Options Report, October 2021
- Programme Affordable Short List Options Report, October 2021
- Programme Affordable Short List Options Report Appendices, October 2021.

These documents are available at: lgwm.nz/all-projects/mass-rapid-transit/related-documents/

The calculation spreadsheet(s) you have requested in questions 4-7 and 14-17 are the intellectual property of the respective contractors who completed this work. As such I am withholding this information under section 9(2)(b) to protect information where the making available of the information:

- i. would disclose a trade secret; or
- ii. would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information.

In addition, this information is withheld under section 9(2)(ba)(i) to protect information which is subject to an obligation of confidence or which any person has been or could be compelled to provide under the authority of any enactment, where the making available of the information would be likely to prejudice the supply of similar information, or information from the same source, and it is in the public interest that such information should continue to be supplied.

The information you have requested in questions 8 and 18 form part of the Indicative Business Case that is still being drafted. I am withholding this information under section 9(2)(g)(i) of the Act, to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinions by or between or to Ministers of the Crown or members of an organisation or officers and employees of any public service agency or organisation in the course of their duty. The release of this information is considered likely to stymie the further drafting of the Indicative Business Case.

We approached our third party contractors about collating the information for questions 10 and 20. We are advised that due to the disbursed nature of this information it would take significant work and cost to collate it. I am refusing this information under section 18(f) of the Act, as the information requested cannot be made available without substantial collation or research.

With respect to the information that has been withheld, I do not consider there are any other factors which would render it desirable, in the public interest, to make the information available.

Under section 28 of the Act, you have the right to ask the Ombudsman to review my decision to withhold some information and refuse portions of this request. The contact details for the Ombudsman can be located at www.ombudsman.parliament.nz.

If you would like to discuss this reply with Let's Get Wellington Moving, please contact Willy Trolove, Interim Communications and Engagement Manager, by email to willy.trolove@lgwm.nz.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Dunlop', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

David Dunlop
Interim Programme Director

OIA-8877 Document Schedule

Ref	Document	Comment
1.	03.08.20 GRG – presentation	Information regarding possible property impacts has been withheld under sections 9(2)(b)(ii) and 9(2)(j) of the Act, to avoid unreasonably prejudicing the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information and enable a Minister of the Crown or any department or organisation holding the information to carry on, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations) respectively.
2.	22.07.20 Board – 22 July MRT-SHI Draft 21 July v1	
3.	19.02.21 Board – technical assessment outcomes and next steps	Released in full
4.	28.04.21 Board – SHI and MRT IBC integration and scope	Released in full
5.	Excerpt from 08.06.21 GRG – presentation (MRT-SHI slides 22 to 28)	The slides relevant to the request is released in full.
6.	22.06.21 GRG – presentation for deep dive	Information regarding possible property impacts has been withheld under sections 9(2)(b)(ii) and 9(2)(j) of the Act, to avoid unreasonably prejudicing the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information and enable a Minister of the Crown or any department or organisation holding the information to carry on, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations) respectively.
7.	Excerpt from 29.07.21 GRG – presentation (MRT-SHI from slide 18 onwards)	The slides relevant to the request is released in full.
8.	03.08.21 Board – programme options workshop	Some information withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i) to protect the free and frank expression of opinion. Information regarding possible property impacts has been withheld under sections 9(2)(b)(ii) and 9(2)(j) of the Act, to avoid unreasonably prejudicing the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information and enable a Minister of the Crown or any department or organisation holding the information to carry on, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations

		(including commercial and industrial negotiations) respectively.
9.	17.08.21 Board – programme options presentation	The information relevant to the request is released in full. Information about the engagement is removed as this is not in scope of the request.
10.	Workshop attendance lists	Some information withheld under section 9(2)(a) to protect the privacy of individuals.