



16 SEP 2024

Email: [fyi-request-28128-9233c12f@requests.fyi.org.nz](mailto:fyi-request-28128-9233c12f@requests.fyi.org.nz)

Ref: SROIA-244

Tēnā koe M Bell,

## Response to your request for information, SROIA-244

Thank you for your follow up request under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act) on 27 August 2024 to the Minister of Health, Hon Dr Shane Reti. You requested:

*Further to your OIA response SROIA 032 (documents 2 and 3), please provide the rest of the emails previously designated as "out of scope" with respect to the specific question I had previously asked.*

*For clarity the document 2 email is printed showing.*

*Sent: Thursday, 30 November 2023 5:16pm*

*Subject: Email from S9(2)(a)*

*Please also provide the attachments that were listed.*

*For clarity the document 3 email is printed showing.*

*Sent: Friday, 1 December 2023 9:42 am*

*Subject: FW: DISCLOSURE incident - approach for a proactive release*

*Please provide these email documents with the "out of scope" sections displayed and including the attachments.*

Please find attached a revised version of Document 3, where we are releasing the first section of the email dated 1 December 2023, which was previously withheld as 'out of scope'. All other information withheld in our previous response under the grounds of being 'out of scope' remain withheld, as this information does not pertain to your request.

I trust this satisfies your request. Under section 28(3) of the Act, you have the right to ask the Ombudsman to review any decisions made under this request. The Ombudsman may be contacted by email at: [info@ombudsman.parliament.nz](mailto:info@ombudsman.parliament.nz) or by calling 0800 802 602.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Jonathan Franklin'.

Jonathan Franklin  
Senior Ministerial Advisor

**From:** S9(2)(g)(ii)  
**Sent:** Thursday, 30 November 2023 12:39 pm  
**To:** S9(2)(g)(ii)  
**Subject:** Email by TWO staff member

Hi S9(2)(g)(ii)

As discussed I can confirm TWO leadership are aware of the email and steps are being taken internally in regard to it. Also please see below our messaging on COVID 19 deaths.

LINES

There is no evidence that vaccination is responsible for excess mortality in New Zealand.

Publicly available data shows that four deaths in New Zealand are possibly linked to adverse reactions following COVID-19 vaccination.

This is in the context of 3,361 people whose deaths have to date been directly attributed to COVID-19 in New Zealand, with more than 12.6 million vaccines administered to eligible New Zealanders as of 2 October 2023.

By chance and separate to a prior COVID-19 vaccination event, some people will experience new illnesses or die from a pre-existing condition shortly after vaccination, especially if they are elderly.

The Centre for Adverse Reactions Monitoring (CARM) and Medsafe have investigated these deaths.

In addition to this, the COVID-19 Vaccine Independent Safety Monitoring Board (CV-ISMB) has compared natural death rates to observed death rates following vaccination.

In the monitoring period for the Pfizer/ BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine (19 February 2021 to 30 September 2022), the observed number of deaths was less than the expected number of natural deaths.

More information about this can be found here: [Who we're working with – Te Whatu Ora - Health New Zealand](#)

In the meantime, we all have a responsibility to stop misinformation spreading, and encourage people to only go to trusted sources to get reliable information.

We also continue to encourage media organisations and social media companies to continue to be proactive in helping to manage misinformation.

One of the best ways to stop misinformation from spreading is by only sharing information from official sources like Te Whatu Ora, the Ministry of Health, health providers, or reputable peer-reviewed scientific journal publications. More information about New Zealand's adverse event reporting can be found here:

<https://www.medsafe.govt.nz/COVID-19/vaccine-report-overview.asp>

Covid-19 vaccination data can also be found here: <https://www.tewhatauora.govt.nz/our-health-system/data-and-statistics/covid-vaccine-data/>

ENDS

S9(2)(g)(ii)

S9(2)(g)(ii)

**Te Whatu Ora**  
Health New Zealand

Te Whatu Ora – Health New Zealand  
[TeWhatuOra.govt.nz](http://TeWhatuOra.govt.nz)

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT 1982

**From:** S9(2)(g)(ii) [redacted]  
**Sent:** Thursday, 30 November 2023 5:16 pm  
**To:** S9(2)(g)(ii) [redacted]  
**Cc:** S9(2)(g)(ii) [redacted]  
**Subject:** Email from S9(2)(a) [redacted]  
**Attachments:** processed-D78EA078-1BE8-426F-A135-F353C1DEF4AA-C198BDB7-56A5-48BC-A5E2-86C02E15CA5C.jpeg; processed-54C5CED8-E420-4203-9364-896FC1BFE7C5-9F850E0A-86B3-4983-A8FF-8D7765256053.jpeg

Out of Scope [redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT 1982

Out of Scope

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

**Core messages on COVID vaccination (the subject of the email)**

- There is no evidence that vaccination is responsible for excess mortality in New Zealand.
- Publicly available data shows that four deaths in New Zealand are possibly linked to adverse reactions following COVID-19 vaccination.
- This is in the context of 3,361 people whose deaths have to date been directly attributed to COVID-19 in New Zealand, with more than 12.6 million vaccines administered to eligible New Zealanders as of 2 October 2023.
- By chance and separate to a prior COVID-19 vaccination event, some people will experience new illnesses or die from a pre-existing condition shortly after vaccination, especially if they are elderly.
- The Centre for Adverse Reactions Monitoring (CARM) and Medsafe have investigated these deaths.
- In addition to this, the COVID-19 Vaccine Independent Safety Monitoring Board (CV-ISMB) has compared natural death rates to observed death rates following vaccination.
- In the monitoring period for the Pfizer/ BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine (19 February 2021 to 30 September 2022), the observed number of deaths was less than the expected number of natural deaths.

S9(2)(g)(ii)  
[Redacted]

Follow us on [LinkedIn](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#)



**Te Whatu Ora – Health New Zealand**  
TeWhatuOra.govt.nz

\*\*\*\*\*  
Statement of confidentiality: This e-mail message and any accompanying attachments may contain information that is IN-CONFIDENCE and subject to legal privilege.

**From:** S9(2)(g)(ii) [redacted]  
**Sent:** Friday, 1 December 2023 9:42 am  
**To:** S9(2)(g)(ii) [redacted]  
**Subject:** FW: DISCLOSURE incident - approach for a proactive release

Proactive

We remind people that vaccines remain safe and effective and that they should keep up to date with their shots to protect themselves, whanau and their communities.

We are aware that one of our staff, with no clinical background or expert vaccine knowledge, is trying to spread misinformation.

What he is claiming is completely wrong and ill-informed and his comments demonstrate this.

Sadly, we have continued to see conspiracy theorists disseminating false and harmful misinformation.

We assure people there is no evidence whatsoever that vaccination is responsible for excess mortality in New Zealand and that they can continue to have confidence in vaccines.

Publicly available data shows that four deaths in New Zealand are possibly linked to adverse reactions following COVID-19 vaccination. This is in the context of 3,361 people whose deaths have to date been directly attributed to COVID-19 in New Zealand, with more than 12.6 million vaccines administered to eligible New Zealanders as of 2 October 2023.

By chance, and separate to a prior COVID-19 vaccination event, some people will experience new illnesses or die from a pre-existing condition shortly after vaccination, especially if they are elderly. The Centre for Adverse Reactions Monitoring (CARM) and Medsafe have investigated these deaths.

In addition to this, the COVID-19 Vaccine Independent Safety Monitoring Board (CV-ISMB) has compared natural death rates to observed death rates following vaccination.

In the monitoring period for the Pfizer/ BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine (19 February 2021 to 30 September 2022), the observed number of deaths was less than the expected number of natural deaths.

It is extremely disappointing to see a staff member trying to misuse our data to spread misinformation. He is no longer at work and an employment investigation is underway.

Out of scope [redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

Out of Scope [redacted]

[redacted]

- Out of Scope [Redacted]
- Publicly available data shows that four deaths in New Zealand are possibly linked to adverse reactions following COVID-19 vaccination.
- This is in the context of 3,361 people whose deaths have to date been directly attributed to COVID-19 in New Zealand, with more than 12.6 million vaccines administered to eligible New Zealanders as of 2 October 2023.
- By chance and separate to a prior COVID-19 vaccination event, some people will experience new illnesses or die from a pre-existing condition shortly after vaccination, especially if they are elderly.
- The Centre for Adverse Reactions Monitoring (CARM) and Medsafe have investigated these deaths.
- In addition to this, the COVID-19 Vaccine Independent Safety Monitoring Board (CV-ISMB) has compared natural death rates to observed death rates following vaccination.
- In the monitoring period for the Pfizer/ BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine (19 February 2021 to 30 September 2022), the observed number of deaths was less than the expected number of natural deaths.

S9(2)(g)(ii) [Redacted]

Follow us on [LinkedIn](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#)



**Te Whatu Ora – Health New Zealand**  
TeWhatuOra.govt.nz

\*\*\*\*\*

Statement of confidentiality: This e-mail message and any accompanying attachments may contain information that is IN-CONFIDENCE and subject to legal privilege.

If you are not the intended recipient, do not read, use, disseminate, distribute or copy this message or attachments.

If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete this message.

\*\*\*\*\*