

24/12/2024

K Jack

fyi-request-28585-445faf7d@requests.fyi.org.nz

Tēnā koe K Jack

OIA: 1337081 – Information about University Advisory Group

Thank you for your email of 30 September 2024 to the Ministry of Education (the Ministry) requesting the following information:

- 1. A full overview and breakdown of all costs associated with the University Advisory Group (UAG), including member fees and remuneration, administrative/secretariat costs, hosting, etc.
- 2. All communications (email, text, phone, etc.) between the Ministry and the chair of the UAG Sir Peter Gluckman.
- Any and all communications to or from the Ministry regarding the UAG's initial report.
- 4. A copy of all submissions received by the UAG during phases one and two of consultation.

On 18 October 2024, you clarified **part two** of your request as follows:

2. All communications (email, text, phone, etc.) between the Ministry and the chair of the UAG Sir Peter Gluckman - I'm happy for you to exclude incidental/administrative communications such as arranging meeting times and other logistics. I am particularly interested in communications relating to the membership selection process including selection and acceptance of the chair as well as discussion of costs associated with the UAG, but also wish to receive any advice, policy considerations, briefings, notes, opinions, or options under consideration that fall outside of these incidental communications.

Your request has been considered under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act).

The Ministry responded to **parts one and four** of your request on 29 October 2024, and advised you of our decision on **parts two and three** of your request on 10 December 2024.

Part three of your request was refused under section 18(a) of the Act, since, by virtue of section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act, there is good reason for withholding the information to maintain the constitutional conventions for the time being which protect the confidentiality of advice tendered by Ministers of the Crown and officials.



Some of the information in scope of **part two** of your request was also refused under section 18(d) of the Act, as the information is or will soon be publicly available.

Please find enclosed as **Appendix A** the remaining documents in scope of **part two** of your request. As advised on 10 December 2024, some information has been withheld under the following sections of the Act:

- 9(2)(a), to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of deceased natural persons
- 9(2)(b)(ii), to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely to unreasonably prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information
- 9(2)(f)(iv), to maintain the constitutional conventions for the time being which protect the confidentiality of advice tendered by Ministers of the Crown and officials
- 9(2)(g)(i), to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinions by or between or to Ministers of the Crown or members of an organisation or officers and employees of any public service agency or organisation in the course of their duty
- 9(2)(i), to enable a Minister of the Crown or any public service agency or organisation holding the information to carry out, without prejudice or disadvantage, commercial activities.

As required under section 9(1) of the Act, I have considered the public interest in releasing the information withheld. I do not consider that the public interest considerations favouring the release of this information are sufficient to outweigh the need to withhold it at this time.

Please refer to the **Document Table Appendix A** below for a list of all documents in scope of part two of your request, including my decision on release. For clarity and completeness, I have included in the document table the publicly available documents that were refused in our previous response to you. Please note, the total number of documents in the document table below differs from the number communicated in our letter to you of 10 December 2024, due to a counting error.

Please note, we may publish this response on our website after five working days. Your name and contact details will be removed.

Thank you again for your email. You have the right to ask an Ombudsman to review my decision on your request, in accordance with section 28 of the Act. You can do this by writing to info@ombudsman.parliament.nz or to Office of the Ombudsman, PO Box 10152, Wellington 6143.

Nāku noa, nā

James Campbell

Senior Policy Manager, Tertiary Policy

Te Pou Kaupapahere | Policy

Stamphell

Document Table Appendix A

#	Date	From	То	Subject	Decision on release
1	6 March 2024	Donna McKenzie	Catherine Ryan Clara Rowe	FW: UAG names	
2	7 March 2024	Andy Jackson	Katrina Sutich	RE: UAG names	
3	7 March 2024	MEMO: Univ		p – approval to begin the	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is
4	7 March 2024		ersity Advisory Grou nent and appointmer	p – agreement to delegate it of the UAG	publicly available at: https://web-assets.education.govt.nz/s3fs-public/2024-10/1333318-Appendix-
5	14 March 2024	MEMO: UAG	Membership and Pr	obity Checks	A.pdf?VersionId=9T_RBLLxTTPpR9QFmtNgpecK7YtY
6	15 March 2024	Andy Jackson	James Campbell	Ministers' view of panel – confidential	QdJ4 <u>.</u>
7	3 April 2024			FW: AUG members – candidates for feedback	
8	4 April 2024			FW: UAG – Weekly Meeting	
9	4 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Katrina Sutich; Tim Fowler - TEC	RE: University Review panel	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
10	8 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar; Alastair MacCormick	MoE/TEC feedback on draft UAG questions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
11	9 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	Conflicts of Interest Register	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.

12	10 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: Conflicts of Interest Register	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.	
13	10 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Alastair MacCormick	Proposed UAG initial briefing material	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.	
13a	Attachment: Initia	ا UAG Slides.	pptx		Released in full.	
13b	Attachment: Initia	Il briefing conte	ents.docx		Released in full.	
13c	Attachment: 2.3 7 framework.docx	ΓEC investmer	nt process and		Released in full.	
13d	Attachment: 3.1 F	unding and pe	erformance by univer	sity.docx	Released in full.	
13e	Attachment: 3.2 Tuniversity finance		er	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a), (9)(2)(b)(ii), 9(2)(f)(iv), 9(2)(g)(i) and 9(2)(i) of the Act.		
13f	Attachment: 4.1 I Education Report METIS 1319472		ducation .pdf number or Internation	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://web-assets.education.govt.nz/s3fs-public/2024-11/3.%201319472%20ER%20-%20Growing%20the%20number%20of%20international%20students%20in%20New%20Z_Redacted.pdf?VersionId=G5XnvRhRGDIpiPYZSvG.cViVL2LGYvk.		
13g	Attachment: 1.1 TEC BIM.pdf			Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.tec.govt.nz/assets/ Ministerial-papers/Briefing-for-the-Incoming-Minister-for-Tertiary-Education-and-Skills.pdf .		
13h	Attachment: 1.2 E Tertiary education		Л redacted.pdf		Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: 141319031-Tertiary-education-and-skills-for-release_Redacted.pdf .	
13i	Attachment: 1.3 L UAG.docx	egislative sett	ings Memo for	Released in full.		

13j	Attachment: 2.1	Challenges and	d opportunities in HE	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://assets.education.govt.nz/ public/Documents/our-work/information-releases/Advice-Seen-by-our-Ministers/November-2023/1Challenges-and-opportunities-in-higher-education-funding.pdf.	
13k	Attachment: 2.2 Funding in TE.do		_Research		Released in full.
14	24 May 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	Engagement plan and planning for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
14a	Attachment: UA	G all staff briefir	ngs summary of issue	es (002).docx	Released in full.
15	30 May 2024	James Campbell	UAG Members,	Vote Tertiary Budget Overview for UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
15a	Attachment: Vote	e Tertiary B24 (Overview.pdf		Released in full
16	4 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; TEC - Deirdre Marshall	RE: UAG meeting this afternoon	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
17	4 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: Academic governance	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
17a	Attachment: FIN	AL University g	overnance models a	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.	
18	5 June 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell	Re: Academic governance	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
19	7 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Alastair MacCormick	Proposed reference material for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
19a	Attachment: Dra	ft international	university comparisor	n June 2024.docx	Released in full.

19b	Attachment: UAG university sector.c	•	erentiation in the Aot	Released in full.	
20	10 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	RE: Proposed reference material for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
20a	Attachment: Draft	international u	niversity comparisor	June 2024.docx	Released in full.
20b	Attachment: UAG university sector.c	•	erentiation in the Aot	tearoa New Zealand	Released in full.
21	11 June 2024	James Campbell	Hema Sridhar; Peter Gluckman; Emily Strong	RE: Proposed reference material for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
21a	Attachment: UAG	all staff briefin	gs summary of issue	Released in full.	
22	13 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	FW: Submission to UAG: Research on the effects of New Zealand's PBRF scheme	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
22a			ased research fund i	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/00779954.2022.2156382 .	
22b	Attachment: Sources of PBRF convergence. Scientometrics 2022.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/s11192-022-04376-9 .
22c	Attachment: An evaluation of metrics used the Performancebased Research Fund process in New Zealand – NZ Economic Papers.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/rnzp20 .
22d	Attachment: Fiftee Review.pdf	en years of a P	BRFS in New Zeala	nd. Australian Economic	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1467-8462.12415 .

22e	Attachment: [nam 2024.pdf	es withheld un	der section 9(2)(a)] s	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/	
23	18 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	UAG next steps	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
24	21 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG Members	UAG minutes and Phase 2 questions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
24a	Attachment: 2406	316 UAG Phase	e 2 Submission Ques	stions.docx	Released in full.
24b	Attachment: 1306	624 UAG minut	es.docx		Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
24c	Attachment: FULL-TES-2020.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.education.govt.nz/our-work/strategies-policies-and-programmes/tertiary-and-further-education/tertiary-education-strategy-tes .
25	23 June 2024	Peter Gluckman	Hema Sridhar; Richard Walley; James Campbell	Please circulate to SSAG and UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
25a	Attachment: 60	_rise_value_of	_research-june15_1	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://ec.europa.eu/futurium/en/system/files/ged/60 - rise-value of research-june15 1.pdf .	
26	24 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: Please circulate to SSAG and UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
26a	Attachment: Sour	ces of PBRF c	onvergence. Sciento	See Document 22b.	
26b	Attachment: The performance based research fund in New Zealand taking stock and looking forward. New Zealand Economic Papers.pdf				See Document 22a.
26c			etrics used the Perfo NZ Economic Papel	rmancebased Research rs.pdf	See Document 22c.

26d	Attachment: [nai 2024.pdf	mes withheld u	nder section 9(2)(a)]	See Document 22e.	
26e	Attachment: Fifte Review.pdf	een years of a l	PBRFS in New Zeala	See Document 22d.	
26f	Attachment: 170	MPI_Phase1_	UAG submissions.po	lf	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/ .
27	24 June 2024	James Campbell	Hema Sridhar; Peter Gluckman	RE: Please circulate to SSAG and UAG	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
28	26 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Summary of Phase 1 submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
28a	Attachment: UA	G themes from	phase 1 consultation	.pdf	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
29	27 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Alastair MacCormick	FW: Letter re changes to academic audit in the university sector	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
29a	Attachment: Lett	er to external s	takeholders on chan	ges to academic audit.pdf	Released in full.
30	1 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	FW: Summary of Phase 1 submissions	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
30a	Attachment: UA	G themes from	phase 1 consultation	.pdf	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv).
31	1 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	RE: Summary of Phase 1 submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
32	9 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	UAG members	UAG - outline of report for comment	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
32a	Attachment: UA	G draft outline.	docx	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.	
33	11 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Material for UAG consideration	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) and 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
33a	Attachment: UA	G briefing in pro	ogress.docx		Released in full.

33b	Attachment: uni	versity visits; U	AG memo on SSAG r	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.	
34	17 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell; Hema Sridhar	UAG next steps	Released in part. Information has been withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
34a	Attachment: 03.	07 Student Refe	erence Group Minute	s.docx	Released in part. Information withheld under section (9)(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
35	18 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	RE: UAG items for discussion	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) of the Act.
35a	Attachment: UA	G briefing on ur	niversity definition.dod	cx	Released in full
36	23 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	NZQA discussion with the UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
37	23 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	UAG members; Hema Sridhar; Hamish Spencer; Tracey McIntosh	Report outline update	Released in full
37a	Attachment: UA	G report 2.docx			Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/
38	23 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	Beatrice Turner; Hema Sridhar; UAG members; James Campbell	Re: University Advisory Group panel meeting	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
39	24 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell	Re: Agenda for next week and university visits	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
40	30 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar; Alastair MacCormick	UAG discussions	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) and 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
40a	Attachment: Inte	ernational gover	nance comparison ta	Released in full.	

41	2 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	Discussion at 3pm	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.		
41a	Attachment: UNZ	Z briefings to U	AG – cover note v2.	Released in full.			
41b	Attachment: The	Cost of Living a	and Universities (1).	odf	Released in full.		
41c	Attachment: Title	withheld in full	under section 9(2)(f)(iv)	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.		
42	2 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar;	FW: Letter from Universities New Zealand - regulatory burden in the university sector	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.		
42a	Attachment: Lette Sector July 2024.		monds Regulatory B	urden in the University	Released in full.		
43	2 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	UAG progress update	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.		
43a	Attachment: UAG V3.docx	Briefing Note	Future of online vs o	ampus-based learning	Released in full.		
43b	Attachment: UAG regarding the aca			sues and potential solutions	Released in full.		
43c	Attachment: UAC and managerial V		Have universities be	ecome overly centralised	Released in full.		
43d	Attachment: UAG	Briefing Note	PBRF V6.docx		Released in full.		
	Attachment: UNZ	Z briefings to U	AG – cover note v2.	docx	See document 46a.		
43e	Attachment: Indic	ative UAG acti	vities July August 20	Released in full.			
	Attachment: The	Cost of Living	and Universities (1).	odf	See document 46b.		
44	5 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: University crisis looms as teenagers say no to degrees	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.		

45	6 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	RE: UAG progress update	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
45a	Attachment: UAG	briefing on un	iversity definition 19	Released in full.	
46	19 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	MoE/TEC feedback on draft interim report	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) and 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
46a	Attachment: MoE	TEC Interim re	eport initial feedback.	.docx	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
46b	Attachment: [title	withheld under	section 9(2)(f)(iv) of	the Act]	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
47	19 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Tim J Fowler	RE: University funding	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
48	30 August 2024	Peter Gluckman	Andy Jackson; Katrina Sutich; Iona Holsted; Tim Fowler; Deirdre Marshall	Thank you to MoE and TEC secretariat members from the UAG panel	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
49	1 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	RE: UAG panel meeting agenda and papers	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
49a	Attachment: UAG	Auckland Univ	versity visit notes.doo	ex	Withhold in full. Information withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i) of the Act.
49b	Attachment: Univ	ersity Review F	Paper Kaupapa Māor	ri Aug 20 LU.docx	Released in full.
50	2 September 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell; UAG members; Hema Sridhar	Re: UAG panel meeting agenda and papers	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a)
50a	Attachment: unive	ersities-for-the-	future.pdf	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://ufm.dk/en/publications/2023/files/universities-for-the-future.pdf .	
51	6 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Phase 2 UAG submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.

52	13 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Update on Phase 2 Submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
52a	Attachment: A3	Academic prep	aredness 230824.ppt	Released in full	
52b	Attachment: EA0	G 2024 – MoE	Seminar.pptx		Released in full.
53	18 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	RE: Update on Phase 2 Submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
53a	Attachment: A3	Academic prep	aredness 230824.ppt	See Document 52a	
54	23 September 2024	Peter Gluckman	Andy Jackson	UAG reporting	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
55	30 September 2024	Peter Gluckman	UAG members	Re: UAG report	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
55a	Attachment: UA	G report Final o	draft nt.docx		Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/ .
55b	Attachment: UA	G report Final o	lraft tc.docx		Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/ .
56	Mon 30/09	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; hema.sridhar@au ckland.ac.nz; Alastair MacCormick	RE: UAG report	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
56a	Attachment: UA	G report Final c	draft ntc.docx	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.	