

24 August 2016

H. Hutchinson

By email: fyi-request-4286-2741a67a@requests.fyi.org.nz

Dear H. Hutchinson

Re: Official Information Act Request

I refer to your Official Information Act request dated 21 July 2016 and transferred to Auckland DHB from the Ministry of Health on 25 July 2016 requesting the following information:

Please provide information/evidence in relation to the Auckland Region DHBs – namely ADHB, CMDHB and WDHB - and covering a time period of the last 5 years in regards to the following questions and requests.

1. What are the respective total revenues from staff and public for car parking levies in each of the last 5 years?

Auckland DHB does not directly receive revenue from parking fees paid by staff or the public. These are paid to Wilson Parking Ltd. Wilson Parking Ltd has a concession arrangement with AMP Investments to run the parking operations on Auckland DHB properties. AMP Capital Investments has an overarching 20 year licence agreement to operate these DHB car parking operations and it is AMP Capital Investments who pay an annual fee to Auckland DHB. These are the fees received for the past five financial years from AMP Capital Investments:

| Period | Revenue |
|-----------|-------------|
| 2011/2012 | \$2,809,000 |
| 2012/2013 | \$3,525,000 |
| 2013/2014 | \$4,034,000 |
| 2014/2015 | \$3,816,000 |
| 2015/2016 | \$3,967,000 |

Note that the increase in the 2013/14 financial year reflects the first full year of operation of the second onsite car park building at Auckland DHB's Grafton campus.

2. What has this revenue been used for?

The revenue funds the development and maintenance of Auckland DHB's travel infrastructure and networks for patients, visitors and staff. Developments include the building of public car parking at both the Auckland City Hospital and Greenlane Clinical Centre and expansion of car parking facilities, among other travel-related initiatives.

3. Has any of this revenue been used towards DHB services other than direct car parking related services?

Yes, as noted above, the revenue is used to develop and maintain travel infrastructure and networks for patients, visitors and staff. It can be used to fund capital expenditure and operational expenditure for travel infrastructure and networks such as:

- patient and visitor parking
- shuttle buses between our sites
- internal roadway maintenance on our campuses
- motorcycle parking.

4. Please provide evidence to account for this revenue stream by providing accounting records. These records should show at least revenue earned, expenditure and interest of revenue gained from car parking levies over each of 5 year time periods.

Auckland DHB revenue from AMP Capital Investments is consolidated into the expenditure described above and is not routinely separated out. Significant staff time would have to be spent creating or collating this data from consolidated accounts. Auckland DHB declines this part of your request for evidence to account for this revenue stream by providing accounting records under sec18 (f) of the Official Information Act as the information would require substantial collation and research.

If you are unhappy with this response you have the right to complain to the Ombudsman under s28 (3) of the Official Information Act to seek a review of this decision.

5. Please provide evidence of consultation with public and DHB employees about car parking levies and decisions to increase levies over the last 5 years.

Auckland DHB engages with health sector union representatives when it reviews parking charges with AMP Capital Investments or Wilson Parking Ltd. Please find attached the following attachments:

Attachment 1:

Bipartite Action Group (BAG) Meeting Minutes 23 June 2016 – Discussion of parking issues with union representatives

Attachment 2:

Bipartite Action Group (BAG) Meeting Minutes 25 February 2016 – Discussion of parking issues with union representatives

Attachments 1 & 2

Have had the information not related to car parking redacted, as it related to matters outside of the scope of your Official Information Act request.

6. What exemptions or concessions are currently provided for people in financial hardship needing to use hospital services or to support a person in hospital?

Some limited parking is available for Starship Child Health and Northern Region Cancer and Blood Service patients and visitors at Auckland DHBs Grafton campus at no charge for people experiencing financial hardship. There are 80 car parks designated for these patients and visitors.

Every service provided by Auckland DHB at its various campuses can also issue concession vouchers on application. Rates are discounted and capped to a maximum of \$10 for people experiencing financial hardship.

Yours faithfully



Ailsa Claire, OBE
Chief Executive

| | |
|--------------------------------|--|
| Bi-Partite Action Group | |
| Meeting Title | BAG Meeting |
| Date and Time | 23 rd June 2016: 10am – 12noon |
| Present | Ailsa Claire (ADHB); Elizabeth Jeffs (ADHB) ; Meng Lin (ADHB) ; Sue Waters (ADHB); Auxilia Nyangoni (ADHB); Timneen Tajjard (ADHB); Dave Lewis (ADHB); Craig Muir (NZNO); Sue Sharpe (NZNO); Len Richards (Etū), Andrew Skelly (PSA); Denise Johnson (ADHB); Louise Morgan (PSA), Allan Franks, Lynn Tucker, Kathy Oliver, Andrew Old, Tut Than, Ian Young (ADHB), Timneen Tajjard (ADHB), Fiona Michel (ADHB), Les Lohrentz (ADHB), Andrew Skelly (PSA); Denise Johnson (ADHB); Louise Morgan (PSA), Gillian Martin |
| Venue | Big Rangitoto Room, LabPlus, Auckland City Hospital |
| Apologies | Jo Gibbs (ADHB), Rosalie Pervical (ADHB), Margaret Dotchin |
| Chair | Sue Sharpe |
| Minutes | Rama Narayan |

| No | Minutes | Leading Discussion |
|---------------|--|--------------------|
| 1. Karakia | Karakia | Allan Franks |
| 2. Welcome | Chaired welcomed everyone to the meeting | Sue Sharpe |
| | [REDACTED] | Andrew Skelly |
| 4. CEO Update | [REDACTED] | Ailsa Claire |

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| | <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>Car Parking:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- There has been an increase in staff car parking charges- Space is a physical constraint and we cannot have more car parks- Patient journeys are more but the number of car parks less- Auckland Council will not give permission for more car parks to be built- Low paid workers paying through payroll is 9%- Ian Young shared a presentation that tracks the work put into the car park project. He stressed on the process where solutions to date have been co designed with employees and patients- Auckland University students are parking in our car park and we are having to be more vigilant- Night shift staff will be asked to park in Car Park A- If we decrease prices only for low paid workers, there may be a risk of more people parking their cars from this group – we need to be able to mitigate this risk <p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Fact based conversation with the Unions in finding car parking solutions - Union reps workshop to organise- Work with low paid workers and disabled workers for a better solution- Staff Residents Car Parking to be reviewed <p>[REDACTED]</p> | |
|--|---|--|

| | | |
|----|-----------------------------|--|
| | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | |
| 5. | <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>3)</p> | |

| | | |
|------------------------------------|--|-------------------------|
| | <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>7) [REDACTED]</p> <p>8) What changes have been made to move more services to GCC to reduce the load on the ACH car park? Response from Ailsa: There has been resistance from the Clinicians as they are less productive if they have to move between ACH & GCC.</p> <p>9) WDHB offers cheaper parking which makes it more attractive for employees – Ailsa acknowledged this as likely.</p> | |
| <p>5. Financial</p> | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | <p>Auxilia Nyangoni</p> |
| <p>6. Health and Safety Update</p> | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | <p>Denise Johnson</p> |



| | | |
|-------------------|-------------------|------------|
| | <p>[Redacted]</p> | |
| 7. NZCTU Response | <p>[Redacted]</p> | |
| 8. | <p>[Redacted]</p> | Sue Sharpe |

| Action Item | Description | Owner |
|-------------|--|--------------|
| Car Parking | Fact based conversation with the Unions in finding car parking solutions - Union reps workshop to organise | Ian Young |
| [Redacted] | Work with low paid workers and disabled workers for a better car parking solution | Ian Young |
| [Redacted] | Staff Residents Car Parking to be reviewed | Ailsa Claire |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |

Hei Oranga Tika Mo Te Iti Me Te Rahi
Healthy Communities, Quality Healthcare

| | |
|--------------------------------|---|
| Bi-Partite Action Group | |
| Meeting Title | BAG Meeting |
| Date and Time | 25 th February 2016: 10am – 12noon |
| Present | Ailsa Claire (ADHB); Elizabeth Jeffs (ADHB) ; Meng Lin (ADHB) ; Sue Waters (ADHB); Auxilia Nyangoni (ADHB); Timneen Taljard (ADHB); Margaret Dotchin (ADHB); Dave Lewis (ADHB); Jo Gibbs (ADHB); Craig Muir (NZNO); Sue Sharpe (NZNO); Len Richards (Etū) |
| Venue | Big Rangitoto Room, LabPlus, Auckland City Hospital |
| Apologies | Andrew Skelly (PSA); Denise Johnson (ADHB); Louise Morgan (PSA), Allan Franks |
| Chair | Sue Sharpe |
| Minutes | Rama Narayan |

| No | Minutes | Leading Discussion | Action | DoC |
|---------------|---|--------------------|--------|-----|
| 1. Karakia | | | | |
| 2. Welcome | Chaired by Sue Sharpe. Sue welcomed everyone to the meeting | Chair | | |
| 3. Minutes | [REDACTED] | Sue Sharp | | |
| 4. CEO Update | [REDACTED] | Ailsa Claire | | |

| | | | |
|--|---|-------------------|--|
| | <p>day or two each week</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We acknowledge that some staff need to bring a car to work – this is about making it easier for them too - Our solutions have been developed with staff, patients and families and Grafton residents <p>Solutions offered for travel & car parking shortages:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Additional off-site parking options are being introduced, close to the hospital, with more staff shuttles - On-site parking charges for staff are increasing from April as our current parking policies encourage staff to drive and park on-site - Revenue from car parking price increases will be used to fund additional transport options for staff such as shuttles - Incentives for staff to trial public transport services given our Grafton site is ideally located to make use of improved transport services. - Other incentives such as free off-site Park and Shuttle trials and discounts for staff wanting to try active modes of travel like cycling | | |
| | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | |



BAG
BIPARTITE ACTION GROUP

Meeting Minutes

| | | | | |
|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|--|--|
| | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | | | |
| <p>[REDACTED]</p> | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | | |



**BAG
BIPARTITE ACTION GROUP**

Meeting Minutes

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|------------|--|--|
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | | |
|------------|------------|------------|--|--|



**BAG
BIPARTITE ACTION GROUP**

Meeting Minutes

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |
| [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] | [Redacted] |

| | | | |
|----------------------|--|-------------------|-------------------|
| <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> |
| <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> |
| <p>11. Questions</p> | <p>Questions responded by Ailsa:</p> <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> | <p>[Redacted]</p> |

| | | | |
|--|--|--|--|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Night shift staff were also a priority, we need to ensure they have a safe / secure / convenient place to park and parking on site for such staff is not an issue. - Day time and peak hours are an issue – Mon to Fri lunch time is a particular issue. - Patient letters for appointments include information on a shortage of car parks and their public transport options. - Interesting to note that a majority of the cars parked in our car park are by staff that live within a 5 km radius from the hospital! - Alternative options are available, we are doing our best but it is not possible to meet everyone's requirements. - We are planning to offer 2 weeks of free public transport to people to try public transport as a viable option. - Additional shuttles are provided to off-site car parks, subsidised car parks are also available. - There was a comment regarding Auckland Transport bus timings not suiting shift timings. Ailsa encourage more such examples from staff so she could pass it on to Auckland Transport for auctioning – person to give this information to is Andrew Old. <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> | | |
|--|--|--|--|

| | | | | |
|----------------------------|---|-------------------|--|--|
| | <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED]</p> | | | |
| <p>11. Other Business:</p> | <p>No other business – meeting closed 12:00pm</p> | <p>[REDACTED]</p> | | |

Hei Oranga Tika Mo Te Iti Me Te Rahi
Healthy Communities, Quality Healthcare