

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

File Details

File Title: 5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

Trigger: IRH

CRM: No

CRP: No

Rationale: ***CAT 3 - Asbestos - H&S Concern***

ANONYMITY REQUEST

Date and time not specified

Details: Asbestos removed from tech block room without adequate warnings or notification to students or community. (See notes for full details)

Location: 581 Bickerstaffe Road, Maungaturoto 0581

PCBU: Otamatea High School

Date Initiated: 22/01/2018

Nearest Town/City: Wellsford

Assigned To: James Moore

Industry: Non-Residential Building Construction

Focus Area: Construction

File Status

Status: Closed

Outcome: Fulfilled

Parties

Client ID	Name	Roles/Duties	Contact Name	Primary Party	Victim
18686450	Arco Group Limited	PCBU	9(2)(a)	False	
2822578	Intertek Testing Services (NZ) Ltd	PCBU	9(2)(a) Asbestos & Business	False	

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

			Development	
2940215	Ministry of Education	PCBU	Martin Wootton	False
18372291	Harcourt Insulation (2006) Limited	PCBU	Richard James Hindle	False
18806258	As Best As Us Asbestos Removalists & Demolitions Ltd (trading as: As Best As Us Asbestos)	PCBU	Ashton Tairua	False
18824320	Healthsafe Monitoring & Consultancy Limited	PCBU	Bob Mumford	False
5562850	Otamatea High School Board of Trustees	PCBU	Traci Moring	True
18845204	Belinda Lee	Complainant, Worker		False

Assessments

Status: Closed

End Date: 26/01/2018

Outline of Intended Process: Assess if asbestos controls have been adequately implemented,

Type	Location	Details	H&S Rep/Worker Interaction	H&S Rep/Worker Name	Date
Desk-based follow-up	On phone	Phone call with Rachel Clothier-Simmonds	No		5/02/2018

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

		regarding current test results and failure of regulation 36 of the asbestos regulations...		
Desk-based follow-up	Desk	Phone call with 9(2)(a)	No	26/01/2018
		Discussion of phases of works, he will send all information regarding asbestos removal....		
Desk-based follow-up	Desk	Phone call with rachael Clothier-Simmonds (Otamatea School Principal)....	No	26/01/2018
Desk-based follow-up	Desk	Phone call with Tim Hayman (Hayman Construction). Gathering further information regarding work done on site....	No	26/01/2018
Desk-based follow-up	Desk	Phone call with Mike Goodison - Clarification of work site in question, teck block work	No	26/01/2018

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

		done by ARCO and Harcourts...		
Desk-based follow-up	Phone call	Phone conversation with Bob Munford regarding testing results...	No	2/02/2018
Desk-based follow-up	Phone	Phone call with Bob Munford regarding Oteatama School....	No	31/01/2018
Desk-based follow-up	Desk	Phone call and email with Greg Irvine from the Ministry Of Education....	No	5/02/2018
Desk-based follow-up	On phone.	Phone call with Belinda Lee Regarding work, she advised me the work had been done prior to the boiler house work....	No	25/01/2018
Desk-based follow-up	Desk	Phone cal with Mike Goodesion frmo Whangarei Office, gave me contact for asbestos contractor involved in	No	23/01/2018

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

the Boiler
 House
 Removal work
 at Otamatea
 High
 School....

Desk-based Desk
 follow-up

Quick phone No
 conversation
 with Ashton
 tairua from
 As best As us
 asbestos
 removal and
 demolition
 Limited....

23/01/2018

Worker Participation System

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Did you speak to an H & S Rep:

Did you speak to a Worker:

Findings

Detail of All Findings: Phone call with Mike Goodison. Mike informed me that some asbestos removal work had been conducted at Otamatea High School a concern has been raised that the regulations may have been breached as a result of this work.

Contact with Contractors doing boiler house work. Provided information on removal.

25/01/2018 Phone call with Belinda Lee (Complainant) to get clarification of issues.

Phone call with contractors relating to the Tech block removal. Information provided

Discussion with the school principal. Information provided.

Phone call with 9(2)(a) Information Provided.

31/01/2018 Phone call with Bob Munford. Information Provided.

02/02/2018 Further conversation with Bob Munford

05/02/2018 Further conversation With Rachel Clithier-Simmonds

05/02/2018 Phone call with Greg Irvine (MoE)

Time line:

Prefab building asbestos removal and demo October according to ARCo no one was at school when this work was done. October 2017 Clearance 4 OCT 2017

Tech Block December. Clearance issued 14 December 2017.

Boiler house January 2018. Clearance issues 18 January 2018.

23rd January file issued to me.

Did not physically visit the site, biased on this time line.

31/01/2018 Additional swab and air testing done at tech bloc, NO ASBESTOS DETECTED.

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

31/01/2018 ACM detected and confirmed on another part of the building, School has decided to remove.

Reviewing the documentation relating the both the technical bloc and the boiler house asbestos removal work at Otamatea High School, located at 521 Bickerstaffe Road, Maungataroto, and in subsequent discussion with the contractors, assessors and school. It appears that the asbestos removal work was for non-friable asbestos containing material on the exterior of the building. ARCP appeared to follow ACOP and Regs, Clearance Reports have been issued for all work.

Based on the information I've received to date, it appears as though the contractors involved have met their duties under the Health and Safety at Work Act 2015 and the asbestos regulations 2016, except as noted below.

The Otamatea school board of trustees/ Ministry of education appear to have failed in their duty under section 36 of the health and safety at work (Asbestos) regulations 2016, in that they did not inform certain persons about intended asbestos removal work, in this instance their staff on site.

I am following up with the school in regards to its failure to notify affected persons.

Further testing is being undertaken at the moment to confirm the site is clear from any asbestos related risk to the health and safety of persons who may use this area in the future.

Part of the complaint relates to the lack of air monitoring during the removal work, Only friable A class work requires this under the Health and safety at work (Asbestos) regulations 2016. The MoE has decided to implement air monitoring on ALL asbestos removal jobs on it property, the contractors have failed to meet this MoE requirement at this school. this requirement is not enforceable under the HSWA (Asbestos) Regulations 2016.

Assessment Re-Visit Required: No

Health & Safety Issues Found: No Actionable Issues Identified

Hazard Management System: Hazard management system in place

Other focus area issues found: Construction > Secondary Focus Area > Occ Health - Asbestos

Issues

Notices

Notes & Communications

Attachment	Type	Date	Description	Created
------------	------	------	-------------	---------

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

By

Note 22/01/2018 ***CAT 3 - 9(2)(a)
Asbestos - H&S
Concern***

***ANONYMITY
REQUEST***

Date and time
not specified

Details:
Asbestos
removed from
tech block room
without
adequate
warnings or
notification to
students or
community.
(See notes for
full details)

Location: 581
Bickerstaffe
Road,
Maungaturoto
0581

PCBU:
Otamatea High
School

RE Otamatea High School
UNCLASSIFIED .msg

Document 2/02/2018

Email James
communications Moore
With the
Complainant

Otamatea High School
UNCLASSIFIED .msg

Document 2/02/2018

Email James
communications Moore
With the
Complainant

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

RE Media statement UNCLASSIFIED .msg	Document	2/02/2018	Email communication with the School.	James Moore
526d50ae-3bc1-431a-96ca- 7fd93299fc5.msg	Document	2/02/2018	Email communications With the Complainant	James Moore
4d7a929e-0909-46a2-a648- 0f9341157f70.msg	Document	2/02/2018	Email communications With the Complainant	James Moore
b80afac6-1d0f-47a4-be6f- d60fcab977f2.pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Tech Block Scope of works	James Moore
OHS Asbestos report.pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Original survey	James Moore
ashton tairua 0190 vis.pdf	Document	2/02/2018	ARCP/ Clearance info from Ashton regarding the Boiler House	James Moore
Arcp plan for otamatea.msg	Document	2/02/2018	ARCP / clearance info from Ashton regarding the Boiler House	James Moore
SC284EA267318012310150.pdf	Document	2/02/2018	ARCP / clearance info from Ashton regarding the Boiler House	James Moore
compressed_28151 (1).pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Documentation from Harcourt Insulation regarding Tech block reroof /reclad and demolition of prefab building (drawing room).	James Moore

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

compressed_28625 (1).pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Documentation from Harcourt Insulation regarding Tech block reroof /reclad and demolition of prefab building (drawing room).	James Moore
Image (1).pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Documentation from Harcourt Insulation regarding Tech block reroof /reclad and demolition of prefab building (drawing room).	James Moore
Image.pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Documentation from Harcourt Insulation regarding Tech block reroof /reclad and demolition of prefab building (drawing room).	James Moore
3ce66eb8-923f-4b84-b52d-2b663281bd9f.pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Intertek Clearacnce report 14 dec 2017	James Moore
905ad481-277a-4851-bd9f-b45c09f2f9d5.pdf	Document	2/02/2018	Intertek Clearacnce report 4th oct 2017	James Moore
	Note	2/02/2018	Note additional inf from Harcourts, (unable to attach email sixe limit	James Moore

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

exceeded.

Hi Richard

As discussed on the phone could you please send me the following.

- o The dates the work was done. The main removal was completed on the 2nd & 4th of October 2017 (approx. 105m²) and then a small area on the 13th December 2018 (approx. 27m²)

- o The ARCP that was used on site for the removal of the acm at Otamatea High School. please find attached

- o An email summarizing the decisions made around air monitoring and the contractual situation at the time of the work. We are requested to send in all H&S documents at the time of quoting so by

default we complete the ARCP showing monitoring to be completed. We were contracted by ARCO to remove external B Class asbestos cladding, at the time the job was started the school was shut and the building/block isolated from the remaining areas of the school. My NI Manager phoned and asked about perimeter monitoring, I made the call not to do this due to the school being closed, the type of product and because the sheets were able to be removed whole so minimal disturbance. At the time of removal the weather was not a factor/concern, plastic drop sheets were installed and the sheets were sprayed prior to

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

removal, as the sheets were removed they were placed on heavy 200mu plastic, wrapped and placed on the truck for transport. Once the removal was completed Inter-teck completed a visual inspection prior to sign off/handover to ARCO

o Any other information you feel may be useful. I have been advised by my staff that some other building work had taken place prior to them coming on site but have no information if this involved any asbestos work.

Directive letter Signed.pdf	Document	7/02/2018	Signed Directive letter	James Moore
Directive letter Signed.pdf	Document	8/02/2018	email directive letter	James Moore
Directive Letter UNCLASSIFIED .msg	Document	8/02/2018	email directive	James

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

			letter	Moore
cd8dec33-8a97-450b-966b-1d0b9447a520.msg	Document	8/02/2018	Corispondance with complainant 08/02/2018	James Moore
EDM Otamatea School.pdf	Document	8/02/2018	EDM form	James Moore
Inspectors notes 02022018.pdf	Document	8/02/2018	Inspectors notes	James Moore
Inspectors Notes 05022018.pdf	Document	8/02/2018	Inspectors notes	James Moore
Inspectors notes 25012018.pdf	Document	8/02/2018	Inspectors notes	James Moore
Inspectors notes 25022018 part 2.pdf	Document	8/02/2018	Inspectors notes	James Moore
Inspectors Notes 31012018.pdf	Document	8/02/2018	Inspectors notes	James Moore
RE UNCLASSIFIED .msg	Document	8/02/2018	Email from Belinda Lee 08/02/2018 1337	James Moore
builders page 1.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
builders page 2.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
builders page 3.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
Intertek page 1.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
intertek page 2.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
school already knew proof.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
Robert mumford email 1.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

Robert Mumford email 2.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
Robert Mumford email 3 page 1.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
Robert Mumford email 3 page 2.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
Robert Mumford email 4.pdf	Document	9/02/2018	Evidence from Belinda Lee	James Moore
Week ending 2 February 2nd te panui.docx	Document	22/03/2018	Notification from school regarding 10th of feb 2018 work.	James Moore
Robert mumford email 1.pdf	Document	22/03/2018	Additional information from the complainant	James Moore
Robert Mumford email 2.pdf	Document	22/03/2018	Additional information from the complainant	James Moore
Robert Mumford email 3 page 1.pdf	Document	22/03/2018	Additional information from the complainant	James Moore
Robert Mumford email 4.pdf	Document	22/03/2018	Additional information from the complainant	James Moore
OHS Tech Block Reroof Site Meeting Minutes 04.pdf	Document	22/03/2018	Meeting foot through roof. and tech block works 10th Feb 2018	James Moore
fae9879b-d306-4540-9e3a-968309efe3b7.docx	Document	22/03/2018	Meeting foot through roof. and tech block works 10th Feb 2018	James Moore

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

3b331f46-e3ad-4143-ba71-644d323fc8d3.pdf	Document	23/03/2018	Dated ARCPS and Clearance repts for clarity	James Moore
45f3abf7-d10a-4286-9e45-8b228c29c2e0.pdf	Document	23/03/2018	Dated ARCPS and Clearance repts for clarity	James Moore
e1d729b5-26a6-4ec4-aa28-fc047abac86.pdf	Document	23/03/2018	Dated ARCPS and Clearance repts for clarity	James Moore
compressed_28151 (1) Arcp ect 30OCT2017.pdf	Document	23/03/2018	Dated ARCPS and Clearance repts for clarity	James Moore
compressed_28625 (1) ARCP ect 13Dec2017.pdf	Document	23/03/2018	Dated ARCPS and Clearance repts for clarity	James Moore
e7001393-91f4-4f8e-8933-7d4f45b7d1f0.pdf	Document	23/03/2018	Dated ARCPS and Clearance repts for clarity	James Moore
c1e36163-3fec-42bc-bb73-7d496a9a6e22.pdf	Document	23/03/2018	Dated ARCPS and Clearance repts for clarity	James Moore
RE Otamatea High School UNCLASSIFIED .msg	Document	28/03/2018	Evidence from Harcourts	James Moore
RE Otamatea High School UNCLASSIFIED .msg	Document	28/03/2018	Evidence from Harcourts	James Moore
RE Otametea High School UNCLASSIFIED .msg	Document	28/03/2018	Evidence from Harcourts	James Moore
FW Otamatea High School IN-CONFIDENCE .msg	Document	18/04/2018	Email Justin Michaels	James Moore

Attachments

File Name: RE Otametea High School UNCLASSIFIED .msg

Type: Document

Date: 2/02/2018

Description: Email communications With the Complainant

5696971 - Otamatea High School Board of Trustees - Assessment

Attachment does not exist locally within user cache, so cannot be included in-line

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT 1982